IN THE ENVIRONMENT COURT AUCKLAND	ENV-2022-AKL-
I MUA I TE KOOTI TAIAO O AO I TAMAKI MAKAURAU ROHE	TEAROA
IN THE MATTER	of the Resource Management Act 1991 ("RMA")
AND	
IN THE MATTER	of Clause 14(1) of Schedule 1 of the RMA
BETWEEN	KIWIRAIL HOLDINGS LIMITED
	Appellant
AND	WAIKATO DISTRICT COUNCIL
	Respondent

## NOTICE OF APPEAL TO ENVIRONMENT COURT AGAINST DECISIONS ON THE PROPOSED WAIKATO DISTRICT PLAN

1 MARCH 2022



A A Arthur-Young | L J Rapley P +64 9 367 8000 F +64 9 367 8163 PO Box 8 DX CX10085 Auckland To: The Registrar The Environment Court AUCKLAND

**KIWIRAIL HOLDINGS LIMITED** ("**KiwiRail**") appeals against parts of the decisions of the Waikato District Council ("**Council**") in respect of the Proposed Waikato District Plan ("**Proposed Plan**").

### BACKGROUND AND DECISIONS APPEALED

- KiwiRail made a submission on the Proposed Plan on 9 October 2018,<sup>1</sup> and a further submission on 15 July 2019.<sup>2</sup> KiwiRail presented evidence and legal submissions in support of its submission.
- 2. KiwiRail received notice of the Council's decision on the Proposed Plan on 17 January 2022 ("**Decision**").
- 3. The parts of the Decision being appealed are the decisions to reject or to accept only in part the matters raised in KiwiRail's submission, or to amend the Proposed Plan in a way that is inconsistent with the matters raised in KiwiRail's submission. KiwiRail appeals those parts of the Decision summarised in paragraph 7 for the reasons set out in paragraphs 8 to 28.
- 4. KiwiRail is not a trade competitor for the purposes of section 308D of the RMA.
- 5. KiwiRail is a State Owned Enterprise responsible for the management and operation of the national railway network. Its role includes managing railway infrastructure and land, as well as freight and passenger services within New Zealand. KiwiRail is a requiring authority and responsible for designations for its railway operations throughout New Zealand.
- 6. The North Island Main Trunk Line and the East Coast Main Trunk pass through the Waikato District, as well as the Hautapu and Rotowaro Branch Lines. The railway network plays a critical role in supporting the social and economic wellbeing of the District and the wider Waikato region. KiwiRail has an interest in protecting its ability to continue to operate, maintain and develop its nationally significant rail network, as well as ensuring the safety and amenity of those parties occupying land adjacent to the rail corridor.

#### SCOPE OF APPEAL

- 7. KiwiRail appeals the parts of the Decision that rejected, or accepted in part, the following relief sought by KiwiRail:
  - (a) new provisions to include noise and vibration controls to manage sensitive activities in proximity to the rail corridor;<sup>3</sup> and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Submission number 986.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Further submission number 1272.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Submission points 986.51-52.

(b) amendments to existing, and new, provisions to require all new or altered buildings or structures in relevant zones to be set back 5 metres from the railway corridor boundary.<sup>4</sup>

#### GENERAL REASONS FOR APPEAL

- 8. The Proposed Plan, in its present form:
  - (a) will not promote the sustainable management of the natural and physical resources in Waikato, and is therefore contrary to or inconsistent with Part 2 and other provisions of the RMA;
  - (b) is inconsistent with other relevant planning documents, including the Waikato Regional Policy Statement;
  - (c) will not meet the reasonably foreseeable needs of future generations;
  - (d) will not enable the social, economic and cultural wellbeing of the people of Waikato;
  - (e) does not avoid, remedy or mitigate actual and potential adverse effects on the environment; and
  - (f) is not the most appropriate way to achieve the objectives of the Proposed Plan in terms of section 32 of the RMA.
- In addition to the general reasons outlined above, KiwiRail appeals the Decision for the specific reasons set out below.

#### SPECIFIC REASONS FOR APPEAL AND RELIEF SOUGHT

#### Rules to manage sensitive activities in proximity to the rail corridor

- 10. In its submission, KiwiRail sought new provisions be inserted into the Proposed Plan requiring all new or altered buildings containing sensitive activities located within 100 metres of the rail network to be appropriately mitigated from rail noise and vibration.
- 11. KiwiRail sought that these provisions apply district-wide either by amending the Infrastructure and Energy Chapter of the Proposed Plan, or amending the relevant zone chapters.<sup>5</sup> KiwiRail also sought corresponding amendments to relevant policies in the Infrastructure Chapter so that the rules sought by KiwiRail appropriately give effect to those objectives and policies.<sup>6</sup>
- 12. In the Decision, the provisions sought by KiwiRail were rejected on the basis that the Commissioners considered that setbacks would provide "some degree of protection" against reverse sensitivity effects for regionally significant transport infrastructure.<sup>7</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Submission point 986.53-56.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Submission point 986.51.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Submission point 986.38.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Decision Report 13 at [207].

- 13. KiwiRail does not consider it is appropriate to rely on general setback standards to manage the effects of rail noise and vibration. The relief sought by KiwiRail has been developed specifically with rail in mind to effectively manage the noise and vibration effects associated with transport corridors.
- 14. The implementation of building design and acoustic standards for new or altered sensitive activities in proximity to the rail corridor does not impose an unreasonable or unnecessarily stringent control on persons seeking to develop near the railway corridor. The provisions seek to ensure that the health and wellbeing of those living in any new sensitive activities is not adversely affected, and that KiwiRail's operations are protected from reverse sensitivity effects.
- 15. KiwiRail does not consider the approach in the Decision adequately achieves this and considers its relief more appropriately reflects an integrated approach to planning that seeks to enable development to occur near the railway corridor in a way that appropriately manages the effects of, and on, the ongoing use and operation of the corridor.
- 16. The Proposed Plan contains a number of objectives and policies that recognise the need for infrastructure, such as the rail network, to be protected from reverse sensitivity effects.<sup>8</sup> The relief sought by KiwiRail would give effect to these objectives and policies by providing protection for the rail network from potential adverse effects associated with reverse sensitivity, whilst managing health, safety and amenity effects on neighbouring activities.

#### Relief sought

- 17. KiwiRail seeks that AINF-P27 be amended include reference to design controls for sensitive land uses to manage reverse sensitivity effects and adverse health and amenity effects on occupants of sensitive land uses and that the AINF All Infrastructure Chapter is amended to include the provisions set out at **Appendix A**, or any such alternative or consequential relief that addresses KiwiRail's concerns.
- 18. Alternatively, KiwiRail seeks the inclusion of the provisions at Appendix A in the General Residential Zone, Large Lot Residential Zone, Medium Density Residential Zone, Commercial Zone, Local Centre Zone, Town Centre Zone, General Rural Zone, Rural Lifestyle Zone, Settlement Zone, and Open Space Zone or any such alternative or consequential relief (including any amendments to relevant objectives and policies) that addresses KiwiRail's concerns.

#### Building setbacks from the railway corridor

19. KiwiRail's submission sought to amend various zone chapters in the Proposed Plan adjacent to the rail corridor, to require that all new buildings and structures (not just building containing sensitive land uses), or alterations to existing buildings or structures, be set back a minimum of 5 metres from the boundary of the rail corridor.<sup>9</sup> KiwiRail's submission also sought amendments to policies in the relevant zones of the Proposed Plan relating to building setbacks to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Proposed Plan at Objective AINF-O2, Policy AINF-P5 and Policy AINF-P27(2).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Submission points 986.53 – 54.

ensure that the rules appropriately implement the objectives and policies of the relevant zone.<sup>10</sup>

- 20. The Decision accepted KiwiRail's submission in part. The Decision version of the Proposed Plan currently includes:
  - (a) 5 metre setback from the rail corridor boundary for new buildings or alterations to an existing building containing sensitive land uses in the General Residential Zone,<sup>11</sup> General Rural Zone<sup>12</sup> and the Rural Lifestyle Zone.<sup>13</sup>
  - (b) 5 metre setback from the rail corridor boundary for any new buildings or alterations to an existing building in the Settlement Zone and the Large Lot Residential Zone.<sup>14</sup>
  - (c) No setbacks from the rail corridor boundary in the Commercial Zone, Town Centre Zone, General Industrial Zone, Heavy Industrial Zone or the Open Space Zone.
- 21. KiwiRail considers it is necessary for the setback to apply consistently across zones and to apply to all new building development (not just development containing sensitive land uses) in relevant zones adjoining the rail corridor. Setbacks are a critical land use control to manage the interface between operations within the railway corridor and activities that may occur near the boundary of adjoining land, and to ensure the safe and efficient operation of the rail corridor. If development near the railway corridor is not appropriately managed, there is a risk of conflict between the operation of the rail network and adjoining the built environment.
- 22. A development standard for buildings and structures to be set back from the railway corridor boundary is an appropriate mechanism to manage this risk. A setback of 5 metres ensures that there is sufficient space for landowners and occupiers to safely conduct their activities, and maintain and use their buildings, while minimising the potential for interference with the rail corridor. The proposed setback does not prevent the establishment of new buildings or structures within 5 metres of the railway boundary. The provision sought by KiwiRail is a permitted activity standard and where this is infringed, resource consent can be sought as a restricted discretionary activity, with impacts on the safety and efficiency of the railway corridor listed as matters of discretion.
- 23. The Proposed Plan contains objectives and policies that recognise and provide for infrastructure and specifically the need to protect the land transport network from reverse sensitivity effects,<sup>15</sup> and seek to avoid or mitigate effects of subdivision, use and development that would compromise the safety and efficiency of the land transport network.<sup>16</sup> The relief sought by KiwiRail would

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Submission point 986.56.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Proposed Plan at GRZ-S20.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Proposed Plan at GRUZ-S13

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Proposed Plan at RLZ-S12.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Proposed Plan at SETZ-S9 and LLRZ-S8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Proposed Plan at Objective AINF-O2, Policy AINF-P5 and Policy AINF-P27(1).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Proposed Plan at Policy AINF-P27(1).

give effect to these provisions by providing for the ongoing operation of the rail network in a safe and efficient manner.

#### Relief sought

24. KiwiRail seeks that the following standards in the General Residential Zone and General Rural Zone be amended as set out below and the provision in **Appendix B** is inserted into these zones.

(1) Activity status: PER Where:	(2) Activity status where compliance not achieved: RDIS
(a) Any new building or alteration to an existing building for a sensitive land	Council's discretion is restricted to the following matters:
use shall be set back a	(a) Road network safety and
minimum of:	efficiency;
(i) 5m from the designated	(b) On-site amenity values;
boundary of the railway	(c) Odour, dust and noise levels
<del>corridor;</del>	received at the notional
[]	boundary of the building;
	(d) Mitigation measures; and
	(e) Potential for reverse
	sensitivity effects.

GRZ-S20 / GRUZ-S13 - Building setback - sensitive land use

25. KiwiRail seeks that the relevant standard in Rural Lifestyle Zone be amended as follows:

# RLZ-S12 – Building setback sensitive land use railway corridor

(1) Activity status: PER Where:	(2) Activity status where compliance not achieved: RDIS
(a) Any new building or alteration to an existing building <del>for a sensitive land</del>	Council's discretion is restricted to the following matters:
use must be set back a minimum of 5m from the designated boundary of the railway corridor.	<ul> <li>(a) The size, nature and location of the buildings on the site;</li> <li>(b) The extent to which the safety and efficiency of rail and road operations will be adversely affected;</li> <li>(c) The outcome of any consultation with KiwiRail; and</li> <li>(d) Any characteristics of the proposed use that will make compliance unnecessary.</li> </ul>

26. KiwiRail seeks the provision in **Appendix B** be inserted into the Medium Density Residential Zone, Settlement Zone, Commercial Zone, Local Centre Zone, Town Centre Zone, General Industrial Zone, Heavy Industrial Zone and Open Space Zone, or any such alternative or consequential relief that addresses KiwiRail's concerns.

27. KiwiRail also seeks that the existing policies be amended and / or new policies added (as required) in General Residential Zone, General Rural Zone, Rural Lifestyle Zone, Medium Density Residential Zone, Settlement Zone, Commercial Zone, Local Centre Zone, Town Centre Zone, General Industrial Zone, Heavy Industrial Zone and Open Space Zone, to ensure that there is policy recognition of the need to ensure that buildings within the zone are designed and setback from regionally significant infrastructure to provide for the safe operation of that infrastructure and the safety and amenity of adjacent landowners.

#### ATTACHMENTS

- 28. The following documents are attached to this notice:
  - (a) A copy of the proposed provisions as sought by KiwiRail at Appendix A and B.
  - (b) A copy of the relevant parts of the Decision at Appendix C.
  - (c) A copy of KiwiRail's submission at Appendix D.
  - (d) A list of the relevant names and addresses of persons who lodged submissions who are to be served with a copy of this notice at Appendix E.

**KIWIRAIL HOLDINGS LIMITED** by its solicitors and authorised agents Russell McVeagh:

Signature:

Date:

Address for Service:

A A Arthur-Young / L J Rapley

1 March 2022

(09) 367 8306

C/- Lauren Rapley Russell McVeagh Barristers and Solicitors 48 Shortland Street Vero Centre PO Box 8/DX CX10085 AUCKLAND

**Telephone:** 

Email:

lauren.rapley@russellmcveagh.com

- TO: The Registrar of the Environment Court at Auckland
- AND TO: The Waikato District Council
- AND TO: The relevant submitters on the provisions appealed

#### Advice to recipients of copy of notice of appeal

How to become a party to proceedings

- 1. You may be a party to the appeal if you made a submission or a further submission on the matter of this appeal.
- 2. To become a party to the appeal, you must:
  - (a) within 15 working days after the period for lodging a notice of appeal ends, lodge a notice of your wish to be a party to the proceedings (in form 33) with the Environment Court and serve copies of your notice on the relevant local authority and the appellant; and
  - (b) within 20 working days after the period for lodging a notice of appeal ends, serve copies of your notice on all other parties.
- 3. Your right to be a party to the proceedings in the Court may be limited by the trade competition provisions in section 274(1) and Part 11A of the Resource Management Act 1991.
- 4. You may apply to the Environment Court under section 281 of the Resource Management Act 1991 for a waiver of the above timing requirements (see form 38).

Advice

If you have any questions about this notice, contact the Environment Court in Auckland, Wellington, or Christchurch.

#### APPENDIX A - NOISE AND VIBRATION PROVISIONS PROPOSED BY KIWIRAIL

#### AINF-RX Sensitive land uses near the rail corridor (indoor railway noise) All zones (1) Activity status: PER (2) Activity status where within 100m compliance not achieved: (a) Any new building or alteration to an existing of the legal RDIS building for a sensitive land use within 100m of the boundary of legal boundary of any railway network Council's discretion is any railway restricted to the following <u>network</u> matters: Activity-specific standards: (a) location of the Any new building or alteration to an existing building; 1. building that contains a sensitive land use (b) the effects of any where the building or alteration: non-compliance with (a) is designed, constructed and maintained to the activity specific achieve indoor design noise levels resulting standards; from the railway not exceeding the maximum (c) special values in the following table; or topographical, building features or ground <u>Maxim</u>um Buildina Occupancy/activity conditions which will type railway mitigate noise noise level impacts; LAeq(1h) (d) the outcome of any Residential Sleeping spaces 35 dB consultation with All other habitable <u>40 dB</u> KiwiRail. rooms 35 dB Education Lecture rooms/theatres, studios, music assembly halls Teaching areas, 40 dB conference rooms, drama studios, sleeping areas Library 45 dB Health Overnight medical 40 dB care, wards Clinics, consulting 45 dB rooms, theatres, nurses' stations Places of worship, Cultural 35 dB marae (b) is at least 50 metres from any railway network, and is designed so that a noise barrier completely blocks line-of-sight from all parts of doors and windows, to all points 3.8 metres above railway tracks, or is a single-storey framed residential building (c) with habitable rooms designed, constructed

#### Include new rules in AINF – All Infrastructure Chapter as follows:

	and maintained in accordance with the construction schedule in Schedule Y.	
Me	chanical ventilation	
<u>2.</u>	If a building is constructed in accordance with 1(c), or if windows must be closed to achieve the design noise levels in clause 1(a), the building is designed, constructed and maintained with a mechanical ventilation system that:	
<u>(a)</u>	For habitable rooms for a residential activity, achieves the following requirements:	
	i. provides mechanical ventilation to satisfy clause G4 of the New Zealand Building Code; and	
	ii. is adjustable by the occupant to control the ventilation rate in increments up to a high air flow setting that provides at least 6 air changes per hour; and	
	iii. provides relief for equivalent volumes of spill air;	
	iv. provides cooling and heating that is controllable by the occupant and can maintain the inside temperature between 18°C and 25°C; and	
	v. does not generate more than 35 dB <u>LAeq(30s)</u> when measured 1 metre away from any grille or diffuser.	
<u>(b)</u>	For other spaces, is as determined by a suitably qualified and experienced person.	
dev	sign report [alternatively may be replaced with velopment meeting construction schedule 'Y' to nonstrate compliance]	
<u>3.</u>	A report is submitted to the council demonstrating compliance with clauses (1) and (2) above (as relevant) prior to the construction or alteration of any building containing a sensitive land use.	
<u>ass</u> met red to 4	vice note: In the design railway noise is umed to be 70 $L_{Aeq(1h)}$ at a distance of 12 tres from the track, and must be deemed to uce at a rate of 3 dB per doubling of distance up 40 metres and 6 dB per doubling of distance rond 40 metres.	

AINF-RX	Sensitive land uses near the rail corridor (indoor railway vibration)	
All zones within 60m of the legal boundary of any railway network		(2) Activity status where compliance not achieved: RDIS Council's discretion is
	Activity-specific standards:         (1) Any new buildings or alterations to existing buildings containing a sensitive land use, closer than 60 metres from the boundary of a railway network must be:         (a) designed, constructed and maintained to achieve rail vibration levels not exceeding 0.3 mm/s vw.95 or         (b) a single-storey framed residential building with:         i. a constant level floor slab on a full surface vibration isolation bearing with natural frequency not exceeding 10 Hz, installed in accordance with the supplier's instructions and recommendations; and	restricted to the following matters: (a) location of the building; (b) the effects of any non-compliance with the activity specific standards; (c) special topographical, building features or ground conditions which will mitigate vibration impacts; (c) the outcome of any consultation with KiwiRail.
	<ul> <li><u>vibration isolation separating the</u> <u>sides of the floor slab from the</u> <u>ground; and</u></li> <li><u>no rigid connections between the</u> <u>building and the ground.</u></li> </ul>	

#### Schedule Y Construction schedule for indoor noise control

<u>Elements</u>	Minimum construction for noise control i requirements of the New Zealand Buildin	
External walls	Wall cavity infill of fibrous insulation, batts or density of 9 kg/m3)	<u>similar (minimum</u>
	Cladding and internal wall lining complying v A, B or C below:	vith either Options
	Option A - Light cladding: timber weatherboard or sheet materials with surface mass between 8 kg/m2 and 30 kg/m2 of wall cladding	Internal lining of minimum 17 kg/m2 plasterboard, such as two layers of 10 mm thick high density plasterboard, on resilient/isolating mountings
	Option B - Medium cladding: surface mass between 30 kg/m2 and 80 kg/m2 of wall cladding	Internal lining of minimum 17 kg/m2 plasterboard, such as two layers of 10 mm thick high density plasterboard

<u>Elements</u>	Minimum construction for noise control in addition to the requirements of the New Zealand Building Code	
	Option C - Heavy cladding: surface mass between 80 kg/m2 and 220 kg/m2 of wall cladding	
<u>Roof/ceiling</u>	Ceiling cavity infill of fibrous insulation, batts or similar (minimum density of 7 kg/m3)	
	Ceiling penetrations, such as for recessed lighting or ventilation, shall not allow additional noise break-in	
	Roof type and internal ceiling lining complying with either Options A, B or C below:	
	Option A - Skillion roof with light cladding: surface mass up to 20 kg/m2 of roof cladding	_
	Option B - Pitched roof with light cladding: surface mass up to 20 kg/m2 of roof cladding	-
	Option C - Roof with heavy cladding: surface mass between 20 kg/m2 and 60 kg/m2 of roof cladding	
Glazed areas	Aluminium frames with full compression seals on opening panes Glazed areas shall be less than 35% of each room floor area	
	Either, double-glazing with: a laminated pane of glass at least 6 mm thic a cavity between the two panes of glass at le a second pane of glass at least 4 mm thick Or, any other glazing with a minimum perfor	east 12 mm deep; and
Exterior doors	Exterior door with line-of-sight, to any part of the state highway road surface or to any point 3.8 metres above railway tracks	
	Exterior door shielded by the building so there is no line-of-sight to any parts of the state highway road surface or any points 3.8 metres above railway tracks	

#### **APPENDIX B – SETBACK PROVISIONS PROPOSED BY KIWIRAIL**

(1) Activity status: PER Where:	(2) Activity status where compliance not achieved: RDIS
(a) Any new building or alteration to an existing building must be setback 5 metres from any designated railway	Council's discretion is restricted to the following matters:
corridor boundary	(a) The size, nature and location of the buildings on the site; (b) The extent to which the
	safety and efficiency of rail operations will be adversely affected;
	(c) The outcome of any consultation with KiwiRail; (d) Any characteristics of the
	proposed use that will make compliance unnecessary.

# X-RX – Building setback – railway corridor

#### **APPENDIX C – RELEVANT SECTIONS OF THE DECISION**

#### APPENDIX D - KIWIRAIL'S ORGINAL SUBMISSIONS AND FURTHER SUBMISSIONS

#### **APPENDIX E – NAMES AND ADDRESSES FOR SERVICE OF RELEVANT SUBMITTERS**