## In the Environment Court of New Zealand Auckland Registry

#### I Te Koti Taiao O Aotearoa Ki Tamaki Makaurau

ENV-2022-AKL-

Under the Resource Management Act 1991 (the Act)

In the matter of an appeal under Clause 14(1) of the First Schedule of the Act

the decisions by Waikato District Council in respect of the

And in the matter of proposed Waikato District Plan

Between Waka Kotahi New Zealand Transport Agency

Appellant

And Waikato District Council

Respondent

Notice of appeal by Waka Kotahi New Zealand Transport Agency on the Proposed Waikato District Plan

Dated 1 March 2022

大成 DENTONS KENSINGTON SWAN

 18 Viaduct Harbour Avenue
 P
 +64 9 379 4196

 Private Bag 92101
 F
 +64 9 309 4276

 Auckland 1142
 DX
 CP22001

Solicitor: Christina Sheard/Louise Espin

E <u>christina.sheard@dentons.com/</u> louise.espin@dentons.com/

Notice of appeal to Environment Court against decision on proposed plan

To: The Registrar
Environment Court
Auckland

- Waka Kotahi NZ Transport Agency ('Waka Kotahi') appeals against the decisions of the Waikato District Council (the 'Respondent') on the Proposed Waikato District Plan ('Proposed Plan').
- Waka Kotahi made a submission (dated 9 October 2019) and further submission (dated 15 July 2019) on the Proposed Plan.
- Waka Kotahi is not a trade competitor for the purpose of section 308D of the Act.
- Waka Kotahi received notice of the decision on 17 January 2022.
- 5 The decision was made by the Respondent.

#### Provisions being appealed

- The decisions that Waka Kotahi is appealing are the Respondent's decisions on the Proposed Plan that relate to noise and vibration near to the state highway.
- 7 In particular, Waka Kotahi appeals the Respondent's decisions on the following provisions:
  - a Amendments to the following rules:

```
i GRZ-S20;
```

ii LLRZ-S9;

iii SETZ- S10;

iv GRUZ-S13;

v RLZ-S11;

vi CORZ-S9;

vii FUZ - S9;

viii KLZ-R1; and

- ix MSRZ-S18.
- b Add new advice note to remaining zones not covered in (a) above.<sup>1</sup>
- c Amendments to AINF-P27.
- d Add new permitted and restricted discretionary rules to the AINF (All Infrastructure) chapter to apply in all zones.
- e Show an effects area of 100m for noise and 40m for vibration on the planning maps to aid plan users to identify which properties are affected by the permitted and restricted discretion rules in the AINF chapter.

#### General reasons for the appeal

- The general reasons for this appeal are that, in the absence of the relief sought, the Respondent's decisions:
  - a Will not promote the sustainable management of resources, and will therefore not achieve the purpose of the Act, including by not meeting the reasonably foreseeable needs of future generations;
  - b Will not promote the efficient use of natural and physical resources;
  - c Will not achieve the integrated management of the effects of the use, development or protection of land and associated natural and physical resources;
  - d Do not represent the most appropriate way of exercising the Respondent's functions, having regard to the efficiency and effectiveness of other reasonably practicable options, and are therefore not appropriate in terms of section 32 and other provisions of the Act;
  - e Do not adequately provide for the efficient function of the state highway network as a significant physical resource, and therefore a matter of national importance under Part 2 of the Act; and
  - f Will not assist the Respondent in achieving Part 2 of the Act by providing for the use of natural and physical resources in a way which enables people and communities to provide for their health and safety (section 5(2)) and the maintenance and enhancement of amenity (section 7(c)).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Medium Density, Whaanga Coast, Local Centre, Town Centre, General Industrial, Horotiu Industrial, Heavy Industry, Open Space, Business Tamahere, Hopuhopu, Mercer Airport, Matangi, Rangitahi, Te Kowhai, TaTa zones.

9623292.1

#### Reasons for appeal of particular provisions

- 9 Without limiting the generality of paragraph 8, the reasons of Waka Kotahi for appealing the noise and vibration provisions are:
  - a Noise and vibration from state highways has the potential to cause adverse health for the occupants of sensitive land use activities located adjacent to the network.
  - b Exposure to noise and vibration from transportation networks should be managed to ensure compliance with the World Health Organisation ('WHO') guidelines<sup>2</sup> set out in *Environmental noise guidelines for the European region* in October 2018.
  - c Due to the nature of its operations, Waka Kotahi is unable to internalise all noise and vibration effects associated with existing state highways.
  - d There should be appropriate controls in the Proposed Plan to manage the health and amenity effects of the occupants of new and altered buildings containing sensitive activities that seek to establish adjacent to existing state highways.
  - e The noise provisions in the Proposed Plan (listed in paragraph 7 above) require sensitive land use to be set back 15m from the boundary of national routes and regional arterial routes and 25m to 35m (depending on the zone) from the Waikato Expressway in some zones. These distances are insufficient to protect the occupants of sensitive land use from the health and amenity effects associated with the state highway. Activities not complying with the setback rules automatically default to a restricted discretionary or discretionary (zone dependent) activity. This approach fails to adequately address the effects on the occupants of new or altered sensitive uses establishing near existing state highways.
  - f A noise and vibrations effects area is a more effective way of managing the effects on the occupants of new or altered sensitive users establishing near the state highway. A noise effects area of 100m from state highways and a vibration effects area of 40m from state highways is appropriate.
  - New sensitive land use and alterations to existing sensitive land use within the noise and vibrations effects areas would be permitted subject to implementing mitigation to comply with the permitted activity standards. The permitted activity standards should also address indoor and outdoor noise and vibration consistent with the WHO Guidelines. A consent for a restricted discretionary activity would be required only

where compliance with the noise standards cannot be achieved through mitigation measures.

- h In summary, Waka Kotahi seeks the following amendments to the Proposed Plan:
  - i Deletion of the existing setback rules for sensitive land use close to the state highway within the relevant zone chapters of the Proposed Plan.
  - ii Addition of a new advice note in all zone chapters of the Proposed Plan directing plan users to the new 'effects' area rules contained in the All Infrastructure chapter.
  - iii An addition to policy 27 in the All Infrastructure chapter to make it clear that reverse sensitivity effects include the potential adverse health and amenity effects on the occupants of new buildings containing sensitive land uses from existing state highway noise and vibration.
  - iv A new permitted activity rule in the All Infrastructure chapter for indoor noise which requires any new or altered sensitive land uses within an 'effects' area of 100m from the outer painted line marking of the state highway carriageway to achieve permitted activity standards relating to indoor design noise levels and mechanical ventilation (to be supported by a technical report).
  - v A new permitted activity rule for outdoor noise which requires any new or altered sensitive land uses in an outdoor living space within an 'effects' area of 100m from the outer painted line marking of the state highway carriageway to achieve permitted activity standards relating to outdoor noise levels (to be supported by a technical report).
  - vi A new permitted activity rule for vibration which requires any new or altered sensitive land uses within an 'effects' area of 40m from the outer painted line marking of the state highway carriageway to achieve permitted activity standards relating to vibration (to be supported by a technical report).
  - vii A new restricted discretionary rule for a new or altered sensitive land use that does not comply with the permitted rules, with specific matters of discretion relating to location, effects on health and amenity, and consultation with Waka Kotahi.
  - viii Changes to the Proposed Plan maps to show the effects area of 100m for noise and 40m for vibration to aid plan users in identifying which properties are affected.

#### Relief sought

- 10 Waka Kotahi seeks the following relief:
  - Amendments to the specified and any related provisions in order to address the reasons for the appeal set out in this notice as set out in **Annexure A**;
  - b Such further or alternative relief, or ancillary changes, that resolve the concerns set out in this notice of appeal; and
  - c Costs.
- 11 The following documents are attached to this notice of appeal:
  - a Annexure A: Relief requested;
  - b Annexure B: A copy of the submission and further submission of Waka Kotahi on the Proposed Plan; and
  - Annexure C A list of names and addresses of persons to be served with this notice of appeal; and
  - d Annexure D: A copy of the relevant parts of the decision.
- Waka Kotahi agrees to participate in mediation or other alternative dispute resolution mechanism.

Dated 1 March 2022

**Christina Sheard** 

Counsel for Waka Kotahi New Zealand Transport Agency

Address for service of the Appellant:

Dentons Kensington Swan Private Bag 92101 Auckland 1142

Telephone: 09 375 1185

Email: <a href="mailto:christina.sheard@dentons.com">christina.sheard@dentons.com</a>
Contact person: Christina Sheard

#### Advice to recipients of copy of notice of appeal

How to become party to proceedings

You may be a party to the appeal if you made a submission or a further submission on the matter of this appeal.

To become a party to the appeal, you must,—

- within 15 working days after the period for lodging a notice of appeal ends, lodge a notice
  of your wish to be a party to the proceedings (in form 33) with the Environment Court and
  serve copies of your notice on the relevant local authority and the appellant; and
- within 20 working days after the period for lodging a notice of appeal ends, serve copies
  of your notice on all other parties.

Your right to be a party to the proceedings in the court may be limited by the trade competition provisions in section 274(1) and Part 11A of the Resource Management Act 1991.

You may apply to the Environment Court under section 281 of the Resource Management Act 1991 for a waiver of the above timing or service requirements (see form 38).

How to obtain copies of documents relating to appeal

The copy of this notice served on you does not attach a copy of the part of the decision appealed. These documents may be obtained, on request, from the appellant.

#### Advice

If you have any questions about this notice, contact the Environment Court in Auckland, Wellington, or Christchurch.

#### Annexure A: Relief sought

Changes sought are in <u>yellow highlight and strike out/underline</u>, against the provisions in the Decisions.

#### Rules in the following zones on Building setback - sensitive land use

- General Residential
- Large Lot Residential
- Settlement

(2)Activity status where compliance not achieved: RDIS

#### Rules in the following zones on Building setback - sensitive land use

- General Rural
- Rural Lifestyle
- Corrections
- Future Urban

GRUZ-S13	
RLZ-S11	
CORZ- S9	
FUZ – S9	
FUZ - S9	

### (1)Activity status: PER (2)Activity status where compliance not achieved: Where (a) any new building or alteration to an existing building for a sensitive land use shall be set back a minimum of: (ii)15m from the boundary of a national route or-regional arterial (excluding state highways); (iii)35m from the designated boundary of the . <del>Waikato Expressway;</del> Advice note: Additional rules applying to new sensitive land uses (including an alteration to an existing building resulting in an increase in floor area of a sensitive land use) establishing within 100m of the outer painted line marking of the state highway are contained in the All Infrastructure Chapter.

#### Rule in the Kimihia Lakes Zone

KLZ-R1	
(1)Activity status: PER	(2)Activity status where compliance not achieved: RDIS
Activity-specific standards:	
(a)all buildings and structures must comply with the following standards.	Council's discretion is restricted to the following matters:
(iv)A building must be setback a minimum of:  (1)12m from the boundary of a road  (excluding state highways) (except East Mine Road where it is located within the KLZ –  Kimihia Lakes Zone); (iii)25m from the designation of the Waikato  Expressway;	(c)proximity to the road- <del>and Waikato</del> Expressway
Advice note: Additional rules applying to new sensitive land uses (including an alteration to	
an existing building resulting in an increase in	
floor area of a sensitive land use) establishing within 100m of the outer painted line marking	
of the state highway are contained in the All	
Infrastructure Chapter.	

#### **Rule in the Motorsport and Recreation Zone**

MSRZ-S18	
(1)Activity status: PER	(2)Activity status where compliance not achieved: RDIS
Where:	admered. Rolo
(a)A building or structure in all precincts identified on the planning maps must be set back at least:	
(ii)7.5m from the boundary of Hampton Downs Road; and	
(iii)25m from the designated boundary of the Waikato Expressway; and	
(iii)25m from the boundary of another zone	
Advice note: Additional rules applying to new sensitive land uses (including an alteration to	
an existing building resulting in an increase in	
floor area of a sensitive land use) establishing	
within 100m of the outer painted line marking of the state highway are contained in the All	
Infrastructure Chapter.	

For each remaining zone not covered above<sup>3</sup>, add an advice note immediately before the permitted activity rules as follows:

Advice note: Additional rules applying to new sensitive land uses (including an alteration to an existing building resulting in an increase in floor area of a sensitive land use) establishing within 100m of the outer painted line marking of the state highway are contained in the All Infrastructure Chapter.

#### Amend AINF-P27 to read:

AINF-P27 Land transport network.

- (1) Avoid, remedy or mitigate effects of subdivision, use and development that would compromise:
  - (a) The road function, as specified in the road hierarchy;
  - (b) The access by emergency services and their vehicles; and
  - (c) The safety and efficiency, including the maintenance, upgrading, development and operation of the land transport network.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Medium Density, Whaanga Coast, Local Centre, Town Centre, General Industrial, Horotiu Industrial, Heavy Industry, Open Space, Business Tamahere, Hopuhopu, Mercer Airport, Matangi, Rangitahi, Te Kowhai, TaTa Zones.
9623292.1

(2) Minimise reverse sensitivity effects (including health and amenity effects on the occupants of sensitive land use activities) on the land transport network through setbacks and design controls for noise sensitive land use activities established in proximity to existing transport corridors.

#### Add new rules to AINF - All Infrastructure:

AINF-RX	Sensitive land use within 100m of state highway as	
	shown on the planning maps (indoor noise)	
All zones		(2)Activity status
within (	Any sensitive land use within 100m of the outer painted	where compliance
100m of	line marking of a state highway and is:	not achieved: RDIS
the outer	(i) a new building that contains a sensitive land	Council's
<u>painted</u> line	use; or	discretion is
marking of	(ii) an alteration to an existing building resulting in	restricted to the
a state	an increase in floor area of a sensitive land	following matters:
highway	use; or	
	(iii) a new sensitive land use located in an existing	a)Location of the
	building.	building and outdoor
	(1)Activity status: PER	space;
	TITACITY STATES. I EX	b)The effects of the
	Activity-specific standards	non-compliance on
		the health and amenity of
	Must:	occupants; and
		c)The outcome of any
		consultation with
	(1)Be designed, constructed and maintained to achieve	Waka Kotahi NZ
	indoor design noise levels not exceeding the maximum	Transport Agency.
	values in Table 1; and	
	(2) If windows must be closed to achieve the design	<u>Assessment</u>
	noise levels in (1)(a)(i), the building is designed,	<u>Criteria</u>
	constructed and maintained with a mechanical	Discretion is
	ventilation system that:	restricted to:
	a)For habitable rooms for a residential activity, achieves	a)Whether the
	the following requirements:	location of the
	(i)Provides mechanical ventilation to satisfy clause G4	building minimises
	of the New Zealand Building Code; and	effects;
	(ii)is adjustable by the occupant to control the ventilation	
	rate in increments up to a high air flow setting that	<u>b)Alternative</u>
	provides at least 6 air changes per hour; and	<u>mitigation</u>
	(iii)provides relief for equivalent volumes of spill air; and	which
	(iv)provides cooling and heating that is controllable by	manages the
	the occupant and can maintain the inside temperature	effects of the
	between 18°C and 25°C; and	non-
	(v)does not generate more than 35 dB LAeq(30s) when	compliance
	measured 1 metre away from any grille or diffuser.	on the health
		and amenity
	b)For other spaces, is as determined by a suitably	of occupants;
	qualified and experienced person.	
		and
		c)the
		outcome of

#### 大成DENTONS KENSINGTON SWAN

3)A report is submitted by a suitably qualified and experienced person to the council demonstrating compliance with clauses X above (as relevant) prior to the construction or alteration of any building containing a sensitive land use.

any consultation with Waka Kotahi NZ Transport Agency

#### Table 1

Table 1	
Occupancy/activity	Maximum road noise level Note 1 LAeq(24h)
Building type: Residential	
Sleeping spaces	<u>40 dB</u>
All other habitable rooms	<u>40 dB</u>
Building type: Education	
<u>Lecture rooms/theatres, music</u> <u>studios, assembly halls</u>	<u>35 dB</u>
Teaching areas, conference rooms, drama studios, sleeping	<u>40 dB</u>
<u>Libraries</u>	<u>45 dB</u>
Building type: Health	
Overnight medical care, wards	<u>40 dB</u>
Clinics, consulting rooms, theatres, nurses' stations	<u>45 dB</u>
Building type: Cultural	
Places of worship, marae	<u>35 B</u>

Note 1: The design road noise is to be based on measured or predicted external noise levels plus 3 dB.

AINF-RX	Sensitive land use within 100m of state highway as	
	shown on the planning maps (outdoor noise)	
All zones		(2)Activity status
within 100m	Any outdoor space that is required for a sensitive land	where compliance
of the outer	use (including an outdoor living space) required by	not achieved:
painted line	another rule in the plan that is within 100m of the outer	RDIS
marking of	painted line marking of a state highway.	
a state	(1)Activity status: PER	Council's
<u>highway</u>		discretion is
		restricted to the
	Activity-specific standards	following matters

a)the required outdoor space is to be designed and maintained to achieve noise levels not exceeding the maximum values in Table 2; and

b)A report is submitted by a suitably qualified and experienced person to the council demonstrating compliance with clauses X above prior to the construction or alteration of any building to which the outdoor living space relates.

#### Table 2

Activity	Maximum road noise level Note 1 LAeq(24h)
Required Outdoor Space	<u>57 dB</u>

Note 1: The design road noise is to be based on measured or predicted external noise levels plus 3 dB.

a)Location of the building and outdoor space;

b)The effects of the non-compliance on the health and amenity of occupants; and c)The outcome of any consultation with Waka Kotahi NZ Transport

## Assessment criteria:

Agency.

a)Whether the location of the building minimises effects;

b)Alternative mitigation **which** manages the effects of the non**compliance** on the health and amenity of occupants; <u>and</u> c)the outcome of any consultation with Waka Kotahi NZ **Transport Agency** 

AINF-RX	Sensitive land use within 40m of state highway as shown on the planning maps (vibration)	

# All zones within 40m of the outer painted line marking of a state highway

Any sensitive land use within 40m of the outer painted line marking of a state highway and is:

(iv) a new building that contains a sensitive land use; or

(v) an alteration to an existing building resulting in an increase in floor area of a sensitive land use; or

(vi) a new sensitive land use located in an existing building.

#### (1)Activity status: PER

#### Activity-specific standards

a)Must be designed and constructed and maintained to achieve road vibration levels not exceeding 0.3mm/s Vw.95;

b) A report is submitted by a suitably qualified and experienced person to the council demonstrating compliance with clauses X above (as relevant) prior to the construction or alteration of any building containing an activity sensitive to vibration.

# (2)Activity status where compliance not achieved: RDIS

# Council's discretion is restricted to the following matters

a)Location of the building and outdoor space;

b)The effects of the noncompliance on the health and amenity of occupants; and c)The outcome of any

consultation with Waka Kotahi NZ Transport Agency.

#### **Assessment criteria:**

a)Whether the location of the building minimises effects;

b)Alternative
mitigation which
manages the effects
of the non-compliance
on the health and
amenity of occupants;
and
c)the outcome of any

consultation with Waka
Kotahi NZ Transport Agency

#### **Amend Planning Maps**

Amend the planning maps to show the 100m noise effects area adjacent to the state highway and the 40m vibration effects area adjacent to the state highway.

Annexure B: Waka Kotahi submission and further submission (separate attachment)

### Annexure C: List of persons to be served

Name	Contact details
Waikato District Council	Gavin Ion
	Will.gauntlett@waidc.govt.nz
KiwiRail Holdings Limited	Pam Butler
	Pam.Butler@Kiwirail.co.nz
Kainga Ora (previously	Dr C E Kirman and Alex Devine
Housing New Zealand Corporation)	ADevine@ellisgould.co.nz
Pieter Van Leeuwen	pietsonja@xtra.co.nz
Ded France	David Control David Control
Parkmere Farms	Brenda and Gavin Butcher
	South.fork@xtra.co.nz
Cindy and Tony Young	tony@lifestyleservices.org
Dean Van Ingen	N/A
Counties Manukau Police,	david.glossop@police.govt.nz
Dave Glossop	
Anna Noakes	noakesa@gmail.com
Ports of Auckland	marbuthnot@bentley.co.nz
Withers Family Trust	john@planmanconsultants.co.nz
Federated Farmers of NZ	plemiere@fedfarm.org.nz
Powerco	simon.roche@powerco.co.nz
Waikato District Health Board	Richard.Wall@waikatodhb.health.nz

Horticulture NZ	lucy.deverall@hortnz.co.nz
Alstra (2012)	julia@kineticenvironmental.co.nz
NZ Pork	hannah.ritchie@pork.co.nz
Auckland Council	unitaryplan@aucklandcouncil.govt.nz
Donna Maria Lincoln	N/A
Ann Gladding	N/A
Fulton Hogan	eloise@kineticenvironmental.co.nz
Dilworth trust	ablomfield@bentley.co.nz
Meridian	Andrew.Feierabend@MeridianEnergy.co.nz
Synlait Milk	penny.gallagher@synlait.com
Stevenson Waikato	N/A
T&G Global	Elizabethm@barker.co.nz
McPherson	julia@kineticenvironmental.co.nz
The Surveying company	leigh@subdivision.co.nz vanessa@subdivision.co.nz
Travis Miller	N/A
Radio NZ	gary.fowles@rnz.co.nz
Jack McDonald	N/A
Fonterra	ian.johnson@mitchelldaysh.co.nz
Poultry industry	joan.forret@harkness.co.nz

NZ Steel	Margaret.gracie@bluescopesteel.com
Mainland poultry	phil.page@gallawaycookallan.co.nz
John Rowe	N/A
Genesis	alice.barnett@genesisenergy.co.nz
Brendan Balle	N/A

9623292.1 4

### Annexure D: Relevant part of decision (separate attachment)

9623292.1 5