

Attachment 2: Waikato District Plan Review
Proposed District Plan - Heritage submission 535.85 former St Paul's Methodist Church



Dr Ann McEwan
Principal
5 February 2020



HERITAGE
CONSULTANCY
SERVICES

Submission 535.85

Submitter Hamilton City Council

Further Submission FS1323.143

Further Submitter Heritage NZPT

Recommendation: REJECT [submission]; ACCEPT [further submission, on the basis that a review has been undertaken by the consultant]

Following a consenting process that permitted the removal of St Paul's Methodist Church from London Street in Hamilton, HCC is requesting this building (HCC heritage item # 61) is scheduled on the Waikato District Plan on the basis that it has 'regional heritage significance'. The building was relocated to 571 Horotiu Road, Te Kowhai in early 2019 and HCC seeks its inclusion on the Waikato PDP partly to satisfy the conditions of the consent for removal. It is not within the powers of HCC to require the inclusion of the item in schedule 30.1, however.

The building has been conserved by virtue of its relocation, as opposed to demolition, but it has no historic heritage relationship with its new site and nor is it now in ecclesiastical use. [The building is currently on the market and is consented for use as a café and gift shop.] HNZPT's further submission supports inclusion of the building in schedule 30.1 subject to a review against the criteria by a 'suitably qualified heritage expert'. A review undertaken by the consultant has concluded that the building does not meet the criteria for inclusion in schedule 30.1 (see below).

Under the criteria used for assessing heritage significance for the WDC district plan review, the former church has no historic association with its new site and therefore if there any archaeological qualities present they will be completely unrelated to the building. The architectural qualities of the building are typical, rather than remarkable, of Frederick Daniell's ecclesiastical work and of the typology of early 20th century Protestant churches. The building can be described as having a modest level of architectural significance in light of the criteria but only vestigial cultural qualities due to its former use as a church. The building has historic interest as a former church but its removal from its original site to another district and the fact that it is no longer in ecclesiastical use undermine its significance under this criteria. It is considered unlikely that the building has scientific qualities that might be brought to light in the future and the building does not reveal a 'high degree of creative or technical achievement' that would establish its technological qualities. The building makes no contribution to an understanding of the district's development (see WDC Heritage Category Guidance Notes) and its integrity has been undermined because a large opening has been made on the north elevation to allow for the installation of modern doors giving access to a deck.

The recommendation to reject the HCC submission in respect of the former St Paul's Methodist Church is consistent with the consultant's recommendations to delete from the WDC heritage schedule a number of other relocated buildings that do not meet the criteria for heritage significance.

