Former St Paul's Methodist Church, 571 Horotiu Road, Te Kowhai

Previously Hamilton City Council scheduled item #61 with a 'B' ranking

Lot 2 DP 522977 Property no. 2019407



[21 May 2020]

St Paul's Methodist Church was erected in London Street, Hamilton in 1906. It was extended in 1914 and served the church community until 2012 when it was closed because it was deemed to be an earthquake-prone building. Sold by the church and relocated to Te Kowhai in early 2019 it is currently on the market and consented for commercial use.

Under the criteria used for assessing heritage significance for the WDC district plan review, the former church has no historic association with its new site and therefore if there any <u>archaeological</u> qualities present they will be completely unrelated to the building. The <u>architectural</u> qualities of the building are typical, rather than remarkable, of Frederick Daniell's ecclesiastical work and of the typology of early 20th century Protestant churches. The building can be described as having a modest level of architectural significance in light of the criteria but only vestigial <u>cultural</u> qualities due to its former use as a church. The building has <u>historic</u> interest as a former church but its removal from its original site to another district and the fact that it is no longer in ecclesiastical use undermine its significance under this criteria. It is considered unlikely that the building has <u>scientific</u> qualities that might be brought to light in the future and the building does not reveal a 'high degree of creative or technical achievement' that would establish its <u>technological</u> qualities. The building makes no contribution to an understanding of the district's development and its integrity has been undermined by a large opening on the north elevation to allow for the installation of modern doors giving access to a deck.

Recommendation: this building should not be included in Schedule 30.1. It has historic interest and some architectural value but has insufficient heritage significance to Waikato district to merit scheduling.

Dr Ann McEwan 7 April 2020 Aerial view of site before relocation of the former church:



Views of former church on new site:







Source: https://www.bayleys.co.nz/2310744

Church prior to its removal:





Source: Dr A McEwan, 9 July 2017.