

IN THE MATTER of the Resource Management Act 1991

AND

IN THE MATTER of a submission in respect of the **PROPOSED WAIKATO DISTRICT PLAN** by **AMBURY PROPERTIES LIMITED** pursuant to Clause 6 of Schedule 1 of the Act seeking the rezoning of land at Ohinewai

STATEMENT OF EVIDENCE OF ROBERT JOHN QUIGLEY

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 My name is Robert John Quigley. I am a social and health researcher. I am a Director of Quigley and Watts Ltd, a social and health research consulting company. and have been in that role for 15 years.

Qualifications and experience

1.2 I have a Bachelor of Science (1992), a Bachelor of Consumer and Applied Science (1992) and a Post Graduate Diploma in Dietetics (1994), all from the University of Otago. I am a member of Environment Institute of Australia and New Zealand and the Institute of Directors.

1.3 My career has focused on bringing evidence to decision making processes. As a social and health researcher I have undertaken over 60 social and health impact assessments, largely in New Zealand and Australia. These include:

- (a) Integrated assessment (health, social, economic and environmental) of the draft Christchurch City Centre Plan (post-2011 earthquake).
- (b) Integrated assessment of the Castle Plaza Development Plan (Adelaide), where eight inner-city blocks were proposed to be rezoned from industrial to residential/retail.
- (c) An integrated assessment of the Greater Christchurch Urban Development Strategy (covering Christchurch City, and district councils of Selwyn and Waimakariri).

- (d) An integrated assessment of the Heretaunga Plains Urban Development Strategy (covering Hastings District Council, Napier City and Hawkes Bay Regional Council).
- (e) Flaxmere town centre Urban Design Framework, an assessment of the potential effects arising from four different options for the town centre.
- (f) A social impact assessment (SIA) for the 3000-place Waikeria Prison expansion in 2017, regarding the social effects on the city of Hamilton, and townships of Te Awamutu, Kihikihi and Otorohanga;
- (g) The monitoring of social effects arising from the Auckland South Corrections Facility (2015 to 2018) (a Board of Inquiry condition), on the city centre of Manukau, and the suburbs of Clendon Park and Manurewa;
- (h) The monitoring of social effects arising from the Waikeria Prison expansion (2018 onwards) (an Environment Court condition); and
- (i) The social and health effects of the Melbourne Airport runway development programme (2019) on the suburbs of Moreland, Brimbank, Hume and Melton.

1.4 I am the lead author on national and international impact assessment guidelines, for: the NZ Transport Agency, the NZ Ministry of Health, and the International Association of Impact Assessment. I deliver an annual lecture to post-graduate students at the University of Otago on the topic of impact assessment. I co-developed a 5-day in-residence World Health Organization training course on impact assessment which I co-deliver with other international experts, at present count, to participants from over 60 countries.

Involvement in project

1.5 In May 2019, Quigley and Watts was engaged by Ambury Properties Limited ("APL") to provide a social impact assessment ("SIA") to understand the potential social effects of the implementation of the Sleepyhead Estate Masterplan (Masterplan) on the local communities of Huntly, Ohinewai, Te Kauwhata and Rangiriri. Where any potential adverse social effects were identified, the SIA was to describe how such effects could be avoided, remedied or mitigated. The SIA would accompany the resource consent application to the Waikato District Council.

- 1.6 I am the author of the *Assessment of Social Effects of the Ohinewai Masterplan* dated 27 November 2019 which was attached as Appendix S to the Assessment of Environmental Effects Report and section 32AA Evaluation dated December 2019. I focussed on the Masterplan as the most useful representation of the likely development of the rezoning sought at Ohinewai. Ultimately, the development that eventuates will be a matter for the market to determine.
- 1.7 I visited the site and local villages of Ohinewai and Rangiriri, and townships of Te Kauwhata and Huntly, on six separate trips.¹

Purpose and scope of evidence

- 1.8 The purpose of my evidence is to provide an overview of the potential social effects associated with development arising from implementation of the Masterplan.
- 1.9 Specifically, my evidence will address the following matters:
- (a) A brief description of the site and Masterplan (Section 3);
 - (b) A summary of the assessment and methodology (Section 4);
 - (c) A description of the existing community profile of Ohinewai, Huntly Te Kauwhata and Rangiriri (Section 5).
 - (d) Social effects of the construction of the development (Section 6);
 - (e) Potential effects on population and employment (Section 7);
 - (f) Potential effects on housing availability (Section 8);
 - (g) Potential effects on early childhood services (Section 9);
 - (h) Potential effects on primary and secondary schools (Section 10);
 - (i) Potential effects anticipated by children (Section 11);
 - (j) Potential effects on existing business in the area (Section 12);
 - (k) Potential effects on health, social, emergency services (Section 13);

1 27th and 28th June 2019; 3rd and 4th July 2019; 18th and 19th July 2019; 24th and 25th July 2019; 31st July and 1st August 2019; and 27th August 2019.

- (l) Potential effects on existing residents of Lumsden Road and Tahuna Road (Section 14);
- (m) Potential effects on community way of life (Section 15).
- (n) Comment on issues raised by submitters relevant to my area of expertise (Section 16);
- (o) Comment on the Council Officer's Report and expert conferencing (Section 17).
- (p) Conclusions (Section 18).

Expert Witness Code of Conduct

- 1.10 I have read the Code of Conduct for Expert Witnesses, contained in the Environment Court Consolidated Practice Note (2014) and I agree to comply with it. I can confirm that the issues addressed in this statement are within my area of expertise and that in preparing my evidence I have not omitted to consider material facts known to me that might alter or detract from the opinions expressed.

2. SUMMARY OF EVIDENCE

Introduction

- 2.1 APL is proposing a zone change from rural to mixed use: industrial, residential and commercial zoning at Ohinewai. This would enable the realisation of the Masterplan where residential, light industrial and retail will be built in stages.

Methodology

- 2.2 My assessment addresses:
- (a) Potential effects of the proposed development on the townships of Huntly and Te Kauwhata, the settlements of Ohinewai and Rangiriri, and the residents of Lumsden Road and Tahuna Road.
 - (b) Potential effects on businesses, social services, health services, emergency services, education, and housing. Using predominantly face to face interviews and focus group, with a few telephone interviews, 107 people/organisations were engaged by the social assessor.

- (c) Data was collated from multiple sources including site visits, community profile, policy and planning documents, reports from other assessors and literature. Together with the experience of the assessor, an independent assessment of potential effects was undertaken.
- (d) A scenario where the infrastructure described in the Masterplan is completed. The staging/year of delivery of social infrastructure (e.g. cycleway to Huntly, sports fields) has been clearly set out in recent planning provisions.

2.3 My SIA assesses the most likely, and largest, potential delta of change that might be experienced. The complete 'scenario' assessed (the Masterplan) has been comprehensively considered and is the largest and most likely development to be implemented. This approach aligns with best practice as it gives the assessor the chance to identify the largest potential change in social effects. Any other approach, such as assessing many counter-factual scenarios, or scenarios where less of the Masterplan is implemented, would simply dilute the effects identified in this assessment (bringing them closer to neutral), or be based off assumptions which are not actively being pursued.

Construction phase

- 2.4 Construction of the development contemplated by the Masterplan is expected to occur over a ten-year period but may extend longer depending on demand. The total employment impact for the Waikato Region is projected, as an employment count, of 411 per year over the ten-year period.
- 2.5 My assessment concludes the potential effects on housing availability arising from the construction phase would be negligible as most construction workers are expected to travel from their existing homes to work at the site.

Employment

- 2.6 The total number of operational positions created by development in accordance with the Masterplan is projected to be approximately 2,600. Taking a conservative approach, the social assessment has been assessed considering 2,072 new jobs. With 300 existing staff potentially moving south from the Auckland-based NZ Comfort Group factories, this means an uplift of approximately 1,772 staff may be hired. Half (of the 1,722) are projected to be hired within the Waikato District and 20 per cent from within the local

area, including Te Kauwhata and Huntly. Most jobs are anticipated to be above the minimum wage and be permanent positions. The social effects of employment are projected as potential major positive.

Housing

- 2.7 It is anticipated that on completion, the 1,100 homes will house 2,797 people. My assessment concludes the development in accordance with the Masterplan would likely have a potential neutral effect on the housing market in Huntly. While workers at Ohinewai may settle in Huntly, the proportion expected to do so is projected to be small.
- 2.8 In contrast, Te Kauwhata has ample land zoned for residential growth and is viewed positively by people moving to the Waikato District. As such, the slower-growing-than-expected Te Kauwhata housing market is projected to be supported by staff who do not want to live at the Masterplan site.

Early childhood education

- 2.9 My assessment concludes the development in accordance with the Masterplan would have a potential negligible social effect on early childhood education centres.

Primary schools

- 2.10 My assessment concludes the development in accordance with the Masterplan would have a potential minor potential positive effect on primary schools in the study area. This arises from local families gaining potential employment and consequently being able to work locally and so spend more time with their family and in their community (and school). The potential moderate positive effect is also projected to arise from Masterplan families migrating into communities, bringing their diverse skills and resources to schools and the wider communities.

Secondary schools

- 2.11 Secondary school principals (Te Kauwhata College, Huntly College, Te Wharekura O Rakaumangamanga) also recognised the potential direct benefits for their students, offering hope and providing opportunities to students to work and live locally once they become adults. Secondary principals also see substantial potential benefit to parents, students and the wider community arising from the opportunity for parents to live and work locally, rather than spend their time on long commutes. Overall, the potential effect on all secondary schools is assessed as moderate positive.

Children's voice

My assessment concludes that the development in accordance with the Masterplan would have a potential moderate positive effect on local children. Potential positive social effects are assessed for themselves and their families, arising from: employment; housing; an increased population; retail; and recreational opportunities.

Businesses

- 2.12 My assessment concludes the development in accordance with the Masterplan would potentially have a major positive effect on Te Kauwhata and Huntly businesses, especially within the context declining business numbers in these towns. Business owners foresaw potential employment for local families and the consequent improvement in their own businesses, and the hope for additional businesses setting up in their towns. Interviewees saw the Masterplan as a potential solution to the limited options for zoning further industrial land in Te Kauwhata or Huntly. The Masterplan was assessed as critical for supporting potential employment growth in Te Kauwhata and Huntly, especially since Ohinewai is the best location in the district for access to these two townships (close to both of them).

Health, social and emergency services

- 2.13 My assessment concludes the development of the Masterplan would have a potential neutral effect on health and emergency services, and a potential minor positive effect on social services. Emergency services, health, social services and Matahuru Papakainga Marae were supportive of the Masterplan.

Lumsden Road and Tahuna Road residents.

- 2.14 My assessment concludes the development of the Masterplan would have a potential neutral to minor negative effect on Lumsden Road residents (western side of road). For the residents of the three houses on the eastern side of Lumsden Road, there would be a potential minor negative social effect because the residents will need to resettle elsewhere but this would be offset by the financial compensation of purchase.
- 2.15 For Tahuna Road residents, due to the distance from the development, the potential social effect is assessed as neutral.

Community way of life

- 2.16 My assessment concludes the development of the Masterplan would have a potential positive social effect on the western side of Ohinewai. For residents on Lumsden Road (western side), there would be a potential neutral effect as they perceive little change to how they would live their life. For Lumsden Road residents (eastern side) there would be a potential neutral effect if their properties are purchased. For Huntly, development of the Masterplan is projected to complement the community's aspirations. The Masterplan is projected to provide a source of hope regarding local employment and business confidence. For Te Kauwhata, the Masterplan is projected to complement the community's growth aspirations by providing employment for people who might purchase within the substantial subdivisions already consented.

Conclusion

- 2.17 Development of the Masterplan offers a range of potential district-wide social benefits arising from employment, particularly in the context of low median incomes and declining numbers of businesses in Huntly and Te Kauwhata. Local people look forward to the jobs and income that would be created, especially those in Huntly. Furthermore, the social benefits of employment would be substantial, at the individual, family and community level.
- 2.18 Development of the residential component of the Masterplan also has potential district-wide social benefits. The Masterplan provides for affordable housing, allowing people to live, work and play in the same township. The employment-led Masterplan is projected to potentially help maintain the population of Huntly (which is declining) and support the housing-led development in Te Kauwhata (which has not grown at the rate expected).
- 2.19 One potential minor negative social effect relates to the three houses on the eastern side of Lumsden Road who may sell/move.
- 2.20 Overall, I consider that development of the Masterplan has the potential to contribute positively to the way of life of local communities.

3. DESCRIPTION OF THE SITE AND MASTERPLAN

The site

- 3.1 The site is currently agricultural land including a few farmhouses. It is bounded at the north by Balemi Road, to the south by Tahuna Road, to the west by Lumsden Road and to the east by Department of Conservation land.

The site is adjacent to 11 residential neighbours (41-85, 52 to 58 Lumsden Road). Further to the west, across SH1, is Ohinewai, a village sited on the Waikato River, adjacent to SH1. It is north of Huntly (8km) and south of Te Kauwhata (12km) and Rangiriri (8 km). The zoning for the site in the Operative and Proposed Waikato District Plans is Rural.

The proposal

- 3.2 APL seeks to rezone the site to enable industrial, residential and commercial development in accordance with a structure plan, which is intended to enable the development of the Masterplan.
- 3.3 The Masterplan enables the following features:
- (a) Industrial and business tenants employing up to 2,600 employees, comprising:
 - (i) NZ Comfort Group's approximately 1,000 employees (a conservative number used in this assessment of social effects);
 - (ii) other industrial tenants (716 employees); and
 - (iii) other businesses/commercial (382 employees).
 - (b) 900 to 1,100 homes comprising up to 740 multi-units and 360 detached houses. With a housing density of 2.5 people/household, this would be a population of up to 2,750, including 559 children aged under 18 years.
 - (c) Provision to support the people in the residences and businesses an emergency service building (assuming 4 staff), bus depot (assuming 2 staff); and community centre / hub / agricultural projects (about 10 staff), caretaker / security / landscaping (about 6 staff) is proposed. These contribute an additional 22 staff.
 - (d) Sports fields, community corner shop, parks, market garden and cafe, orchard/beehives, wetlands and shared pathways/connections to the DOC Reserve. To provide certainty, staging/timing of these is described in the planning provisions and in the evidence of Mr Olliver.
- 3.4 Importantly, the Masterplan enables a jobs-led development, meaning that people have the potential to work, live, learn and play in the same township.

This is quite different to a housing-led development where people commute away from their communities, to work.

- 3.5 For those who wish to commute, a cycleway on the old highway to Huntly, and a bus station to support potential bus services. To provide certainty, staging/timing of these is described in the planning provisions. Connections by car (and bus) are rapid, via the Waikato Expressway, with a full cloverleaf interchange at Ohinewai to support vehicle travel to or from, north or south.

4. **APPROACH AND METHODOLOGY**

- 4.1 The statutory framework for the assessment is the Resource Management Act 1991 (RMA) and relevant regional and district and regional planning instruments. Section 5 of the RMA states the purpose of the Act is “to promote the sustainable management of natural and physical resources.”

- 4.2 The purpose of my assessment is to assist in the determination of whether development of the Masterplan will enable people and communities to provide for their social well-being while avoiding, remedying or mitigating any adverse social effects on the people and communities surrounding the site.

- 4.3 Social impact assessment (SIA) is the most common framework used to analyse, monitor and manage the social consequences of proposed developments. However, SIA does not start with a checklist of potential impacts but must instead identify potential social impacts from an awareness of the project and an understanding of how the proposed project might affect what is important to the project’s stakeholders.

- 4.4 To complement the above, site and stakeholder specific information was considered to further understand the enabled Masterplan and what might be important to stakeholders. Information from the June 2019 community meeting in Ohinewai also informed the scope.

- 4.5 Consequently, using predominantly face to face interviews and focus group, with a few telephone interviews, 107 people/organisations were engaged by the social assessor:

- (a) Health, social and emergency services e.g. General Practices, dentist, maternal health, Police, Ambulance, Ministry of Social Development, Ministry of Education, Matahuru Papakainga Marae, etc. (23)
- (b) Childcare centres, primary and secondary schools, and Wananga (17)

- (c) Businesses (25)
 - (d) Huntly Community Board members (3), Te Kauwhata Community Committee members (2), Ohinewai Area Committee members (3)
 - (e) Lumsden Road and Tahuna Road residents (10)
 - (f) Primary school children at Ohinewai School (8)
 - (g) Real estate agents, property managers, campground managers (7)
 - (h) Mayor and senior staff from Waikato District Council (5)
 - (i) APL and associated team (4).
- 4.6 Taken together, the conceptual framework for my assessment relates to construction and operational social effects:
- (a) Arising from new businesses and employment;
 - (b) Arising from new staff and new residents;
 - (c) On community way of life;
 - (d) Arising from being a direct neighbour;
 - (e) Arising from the transport needs of staff, construction workforce, materials, etc.
- 4.7 My assessment focuses on items (a) to (d). Item (e) is covered in a transport impact assessment, though the social consequences of transport are covered in this report.
- 4.8 When considering the geographic study area, consideration was paid to where the potential 2,022 employees and their families might live. The study area is Ohinewai, Huntly, Te Kauwhata, and Rangiriri.
- 4.9 Finally, potentially affected groups must be considered and together this leads to the key assessment questions: What are the potential social effects on the following potentially affected groups:
- (a) The townships of Huntly and Te Kauwhata, and settlements of Ohinewai and Rangiriri and their associated social, health, emergency, and education services, and businesses
 - (b) Lumsden Road (east and west sides) and Tahuna Road residents.

4.10 My assessment considers the effects of rezoning, assuming that the rezoned land enables development generally in accordance with the Masterplan. This is the most useful basis for assessing the anticipated development of the site.

4.11 The implications of Covid-19 on the findings of the assessment of social effects were also considered. In summary, there is increased uncertainty about the timing of social effects due a potential slow-down in the New Zealand economy. However long-term, the social effects remain as assessed.

5. **EXISTING COMMUNITY PROFILE**

5.1 The Waikato District sits by the western boundary of 'the Golden Triangle' (as described by economic commentators). The Hamilton to Auckland Growth corridor (State Highway 1 ("SH 1") and the North Island Main Trunk railway line ("NIMT")) runs through the district, and roughly matches the western boundary of the Golden Triangle. As I understand it, immediate proximity to SH1 and NIMT were critical factors in selecting the Ohinewai site.

5.2 Huntly is the largest township (population 6,954) in the Waikato District, followed by Ngaruawahia (population 5,127), Tuakau (population 4,182), Raglan (population 2,736) and Te Kauwhata (population 1,473). Ohinewai and Rangiriri (populations of 159 and 63) are best described as villages.

5.3 Without a major urban centre, the district does not have a retail or hospitality destination. The land mass of the Waikato District is large and therefore access to quality services varies from excellent to poor, dependent on the service required and the geographic location lived in.

5.4 The rural areas surrounding each of the townships are lightly populated, zoned rural, and a patchwork of green grass and other crops. For the Waikato District, dairy farming and processing is the most significant industry.

5.5 The population of the Waikato District has grown, with a 22.3 per cent uplift between the 2001 and 2013 census. Te Kauwhata has experienced 35 percent growth over the same time, while there was population decline in Huntly West and little growth for Huntly East over the same 12-year period.

5.6 The (much smaller) census area unit of Rangiriri is seeing a steady decrease in population (about two people per year), while the census area units of *North of Lumsden Road* and *Around Ohinewai School* show an increase in population of about one person per year.

- 5.7 The NZ Deprivation Index calculates the level of privilege or deprivation in geographic areas based on nine variables from household census data including: No access to internet at home; In receipt of a means-tested benefit; Adult(s) with no qualifications; Adults unemployed; Living in high bedroom-occupancy housing; Not living in their own home; etc.
- 5.8 Such data provides context as to which communities require greater or lesser support of their positive characteristics, if those communities are to meet their aspirations. The NZ Deprivation Index reflects access to employment and quality housing, both topics of interest in this assessment.
- 5.9 As it transpires, Huntly East and Huntly West are some of the most deprived areas in New Zealand (NZ Deprivation Index level of nine and ten (out of ten)).
- 5.10 The deprivation ratings for Ohinewai and Rangiriri are also worse than the national average, with levels of seven and eight. Whereas the census area unit *North of Tahuna Road* is rated about average for deprivation/privilege (level of five). Similarly, the geographic areas in and around Te Kauwhata are rated at about the national average for deprivation/privilege (level of six). This is because Te Kauwhata is likely comprised of households with substantial privilege and households with substantial deprivation. In summary, Te Kauwhata is less deprived than Ohinewai/Rangiriri, and Ohinewai/Rangiriri are less deprived than Huntly.

6. **CONSTRUCTION PHASE**

- 6.1 Construction of the development (in accordance with the Masterplan) is expected to occur over a ten year period, but may extend longer depending on demand. The total employment impact for the Waikato Region is projected, as an employment count, of 411 per year over the ten year period (Property Economics, 2019).
- 6.2 The Waikato is not without similarly large-scale construction projects (i.e. the Waikato Expressway, Waikeria Prison expansion and the Ruakura Inland Port).
- 6.3 Ohinewai sits inside the so called 'Golden Triangle' of Hamilton, Tauranga and Auckland. Statistics NZ data (2018) show over half of New Zealand's population (50.6%) are within this area, and this is projected to increase to 54.7% by 2043. Employment growth between 2010 and 2018 in the Golden Triangle was 66% of all national growth.

- 6.4 As such, the proposed construction of Sleepyhead Estate can draw on those resources, but either those resources will travel each day, or people will temporarily relocate while they work on the project.
- 6.5 It is projected that the workforce would drive to the construction site from either Auckland or Hamilton. The excellent access to the Waikato Expressway will further increase the likelihood of workers driving to the site.
- 6.6 Construction workers are known (at similar scale sites) to travel for up to 1.5 hours for work. Travel times to Ohinewai, from Auckland (about 1 hour) and Hamilton (about 45 minutes) are therefore well within that margin.
- 6.7 Furthermore, investigations are underway for construction workers to be accommodated on-site. The workers would use the existing houses (of which there are five) for communal living, kitchens and showering, while sleeping in compact houses placed around each existing house.
- 6.8 The Huntly Domain Campground may also be a source of overflow accommodation should it be required.
- 6.9 Overall, this assessment concludes that potential construction effects on local housing will be negligible, with respect to availability of accommodation in the surrounding townships.

7. **EMPLOYMENT AND POPULATION**

- 7.1 The Masterplan allows for up to 2,600 additional jobs. Taking a conservative estimate of 1,000 additional NZ Comfort Group employees potentially required, about 300 are expected to move south from the existing factory, leaving 700 to be hired. A further 650 (additional light industrial staff), 400 (additional retail staff), 22 (additional support service staff) are estimated to fill the balance of the industrial, retail and social service space. A conservative estimate of the total number of employees required is therefore 1,772. Including the 300 moving from the Auckland factories, the potential total workforce number at the Masterplan site assessed for the social assessment is a conservative 2,022.
- 7.2 In Section 9 of his statement of evidence, Mr Osborne indicates the Masterplan site would not result in the loss of other jobs already in the economy. He goes on to conclude that ongoing activities from the Masterplan will contribute 1,088 equivalent jobs to the local catchment.
- 7.3 Hiring staff from Huntly is a stated aim of NZ Comfort Group. I understand that NZ Comfort Group is also working with Waikato-Tainui and Wintec to

encourage local employment via a proposed School of Secondary Tertiary Studies. Also, work has begun, with Huntly locals being trained/employed in South Auckland factories first (staff are currently being bussed up/back each day) to be ready to begin operations in Ohinewai as the stage one factory opens.

- 7.4 In interviews, other stakeholders expressed a wish to work alongside NZ Comfort Group to maximise local employment. These include the Ministry of Social Development regional office, Te Kauwhata College and Huntly College.
- 7.5 Regarding where the workers might live, urban centres are desired by New Zealand families (greater than 90 per cent of New Zealanders live in urban environments). Given the growth experienced in Te Kauwhata and Hamilton City (driven by their popularity with migrant families and workers), it is assessed that these two (together with the Sleepyhead Estate itself) will continue to attract the bulk of workers who move for employment. The many townships in the Waikato Region are expected to attract a modest proportion of the new migrant families. Huntly is assessed to remain less popular as in the past, until/unless it can shed the negative perception many outsiders hold.
- 7.6 The potential social effects of this employment from within each township's existing labour pool and migration into each township, are potentially substantial. For example, further sections in this study consider the potential effects of migration on the education system, the health system, housing, etc. The explicit benefits of employment are briefly described here.
- 7.7 The potential social effects of employment on each township's existing labour pool and migration into each township are positive and substantial. Social effects are experienced at an individual level, at the level of the individual's family including children, and at the community level. At the individual and family level, employment contributes to outcomes such as living standards, health and wellbeing, mental health, social connection, personal identity and life satisfaction. At the community level, employment contributes money and resources to a community, social capital and social cohesion, and contributes more broadly to achieving societal goals². To sum up, employment and consequent income are the two largest determinants of a person's (and their household's) health and wellbeing. As described by one interviewee: "*This*

2 Quigley and Watts Ltd (2014). Social value of a job. Wellington: MPI.

will be transformational for our clients. To be able to offer them a range of jobs will be excellent" (MSD Regional interviewee).

- 7.8 The median income in most of the surrounding areas is low, reflecting the predominant low wage economy and relatively high proportions of people on benefits, be that superannuation in Te Kauwhata, or unemployment and sole parent benefit in Huntly. While the Sleepyhead Estate has the potential to create some low wage jobs, most jobs will be at incomes substantially higher than experienced by many living in the study area. For example, an average factory worker at NZ Comfort Group earns approximately \$41,700. This is twenty-seven percent higher than the minimum wage salary of \$32,760 (40-hour week, 52 weeks). Furthermore, NZ Comfort Group jobs are stable, permanent positions, which increase the likelihood of achieving the individual and family social benefits described above (in contrast to insecure, piecemeal or contract employment).
- 7.9 Overall, the jobs potentially provided by the Masterplan are assessed to have a 'major', positive effect on 'many' people. The likelihood of the effect occurring is assessed to be 'almost certain'.

8. HOUSING

Context

- 8.1 Within the study area, ten housing-specific interviews were held with real estate agents, rental property managers, short term accommodation providers such as holiday parks and bank managers.
- 8.2 Te Kauwhata real estate agents described the current Te Kauwhata housing market as "steady growth", but it is not growing at the higher rate which people have been expecting. Up to three-quarters of the new Te Kauwhata developments are being sold to workers/families who commute, mainly to Auckland. Real Estate agents, and many other interviewees, described this as a less than ideal scenario. This is because people work away, continue to school their children in Auckland, socialise away, and shop away. Many interviewees now describe Te Kauwhata as a dormitory town. Existing Te Kauwhata housing is selling for at least \$500,000. New house/land packages begin at low \$500,000s and go far higher. In contrast, Hamilton is \$550,000 to \$700,000, and Pokeno is \$700,000³.

3 Ministry of Housing and Urban Development's Housing Market Indicators at <https://www.hud.govt.nz/news-and-resources/statistics-and-research/housing-market-indicators/>

- 8.3 The Huntly housing market consists of predominantly older housing stock and is split into two geographical areas: Huntly West (about 900 homes) and Huntly East (about 1,500 homes). The housing market in Huntly attracts a strong negative perception from those who do not live there. It is particularly true for Huntly West, which attracts a strong negative perception, even from many who live in Huntly.
- 8.4 Also unhelpful is the subsidence issues faced by many residential properties, a remnant of past mining activity. Despite this negativity, many Huntly locals appreciate the many small shops available (and supermarket), were proud of Huntly and were annoyed at the negative perception others hold of their town. Real estate in Huntly sell quickly and continues to sell at ever-increasing prices (and has done over the past five years). However Huntly homes remain substantially more affordable than elsewhere. For example, an average house in Huntly might sell for \$400,000 and a 'doer upper' in a less desirable area would sell for \$320,000.
- 8.5 All participants said that the older housing stock in Ohinewai or Rangiriri has no stigma attached to it. If anything, both settlements '*fly under the radar*' for most people in the region. Sales are rare, and an average house would sell in the \$400,000 to low \$500,000 range. Rangiriri is similarly priced.
- 8.6 Bank managers described that while \$400,000 to \$500,000 is considered 'affordable' for most, many bank customers would not be able to raise the necessary deposit or service a mortgage of that size. As such, Huntly remains the best option for affordable (but older) housing stock.

Potential effects

- 8.7 The development is proposing to create 900-1,100 new homes, including a range of typologies, some within a financially accessible price range (with a price point of \$500,000, some lower, some higher). In contrast to Te Kauwhata, these homes would be located beside a substantial employment base. In contrast to Huntly, there is suitable land to build new homes and the homes would be new. As set out in Mr Gaze's evidence, it is proposed that a number of these homes will be made available for staff working at NZ Comfort Group.⁴
- 8.8 Nearly all interviewees agreed that the housing aspect of the Masterplan was appropriate. People especially liked the potential for residents to be able to

4 Statement of evidence of David Gaze, paragraphs 5.12-5.22.

work and live in one place. This appears to connect well to the Waikato Blueprint goal of liveable, thriving and connected communities. Several interviewees mentioned the environmental and climate change benefits of such planning, with comments about the stark contrast with the new dormitory subdivisions in Te Kauwhata. Participants also agreed that not everyone who worked at Ohinewai would live nearby, and that housing in Huntly and Te Kauwhata might appeal to some of the workers.

- 8.9 The potential effect on Te Kauwhata housing is therefore assessed to be mixed. On one hand, Te Kauwhata's new housing stock will potentially face increased competition from the well-designed Sleepyhead Estate which incorporates employment opportunities and social infrastructure. But this will be substantially countered by not all staff at Ohinewai wanting to live alongside their colleagues at the site. Te Kauwhata is seen as the most desirable residential location nearby with long-established social infrastructure, and as such it is expected to benefit via staff purchasing new and older housing stock there. Te Kauwhata is already primed for substantial growth and the employment provided by the Masterplan has the potential to support this.
- 8.10 Additionally, Te Kauwhata residents who work nearby (in Ohinewai) have the potential to offset the currently larger number of Te Kauwhata residents who are commuting long distances to Hamilton and Auckland. As such the potential effect on housing in Te Kauwhata is projected to be positive; the magnitude of effect is assessed to be 'moderate'; and the likelihood of the effect is assessed to be 'likely'.
- 8.11 The Huntly housing market (rental and sales) is tight. The potential sale price of new housing and land at Sleepyhead Estate, despite being 'affordable', is still over \$100,000 higher than older stock in Huntly. As such, it is assessed that a proportion of first home buyers who work at Ohinewai will buy in Huntly. However, this proportion is expected to be small, unless or until the negative stigma associated with purchasing in Huntly is reversed. Similarly, the very low population growth in Huntly is expected to be maintained, due to the difficulty of developing residential land (steep on the hills, potential subsidence on the flat) and continued negative perceptions. As such, the potential effect on the Huntly housing market is expected to be negligible within what is already a dynamic market.
- 8.12 For Ohinewai, one housing-related concern was raised by two interviewees (as hearsay from what they had heard from another local person). They described a concern where the Masterplan site might become 'a slum' if the

NZ Comfort Group business folds and staff are made redundant. While NZ Comfort Group is the anchor tenant, a further 1000 jobs are projected to be created by other businesses. Also, the Waikato Blueprint confirms there is a shortage of industrial land in the Waikato District, so in the unlikely event the NZ Comfort Group goes out of business, the land would remain desirable to other businesses due to its location within the Golden Triangle, and alongside State Highway 1 and the NIMT rail line. Similarly, there is an acknowledged, substantial shortfall, of anticipated residential housing in the Waikato Blueprint, even with a fully built residential component to Sleepyhead Estate. This is confirmed in Section 6 of Mr Heath's evidence. Together, housing and land fundamentals strongly work against the potential of Ohinewai becoming 'a slum', and such a scenario is considered highly unlikely.

- 8.13 One Tahuna Road resident was unimpressed with the potential for working families to move into the area and believed they '*need to spread out the people*'. Despite hearing that people who were unemployed would be unable to afford the housing (as described by the banking interviewees) and that residents would include workers at the factory, the resident maintained their view. Ohinewai interviewees suggested that if senior managers moved into the Masterplan site that it would provide assurance.
- 8.14 A second concern raised by Ohinewai residents was the potential for future industrial land use on the western side of the Expressway (i.e. Ohinewai North road and Ohinewai South Road). Residents were concerned the Masterplan was the 'thin end of the wedge', and that additional industrial development on the western side of the Expressway (the opposite side to the Masterplan) would affect the rural living experienced by the village residents. This is a good question; however, it would be unlikely that should the Masterplan be approved, that additional industrial land be zoned on the western side of the Expressway, though this is a decision for the Waikato District Council. Residents could see, and hoped, that any future planning decisions would group industrial uses together, on the eastern side of the Expressway. Indeed, this is supported by the Waikato District Council officer's report not recommending such rezoning. This is also supported by the knowledge that Ohinewai School is on the western side, adjacent to the rural residential living zones, and it too would benefit from continued residential zoning, and no increase in heavy vehicles that would accompany an industrial land use change. As such, the potential effect on rural residential living on the western side of the Expressway is assessed to be positive.

8.15 In summary, this assessment concludes that the Masterplan will potentially have a neutral effect on the housing market in Huntly. While workers at Ohinewai may settle in Huntly, the proportion expected to do so is small. In contrast, Te Kauwhata has ample land zoned for residential growth and is viewed positively by people moving to the Waikato District. As such, the slower-growing-than-expected Te Kauwhata housing market is projected to be positively supported by Ohinewai workers who do not want to live in the Masterplan site. Potential effects on Ohinewai housing are assessed to be positive for residents on the western side of the Expressway due to the reduced likelihood of industrial land use changes in what is desired to be a rural residential area.

9. **EARLY CHILDHOOD EDUCATION SERVICES**

Context

9.1 Within the study area, face-to-face interviews were held with head teachers, managers or owners at the following eight early childhood education centres. Additional context on early childhood education services is available from the author.

Potential social effects

9.2 All centres were asked about their views on the Masterplan in general. The response to this question was always positive, with interviewees talking about the employment offered for locals, the prospect of new families moving to the area for employment, and potential relief for parents/families who currently commute for long hours away for work. Several centres described how families had left Te Kauwhata and Huntly because they could not find appropriate work or could no longer manage the commute.

9.3 Given the existing spare capacity and the desire for growth from some centres, it is assessed there is adequate forward capacity for early childhood centres in both Te Kauwhata and Huntly. Together with the potential reduction in stresses on family life from the ability for parents to live and work in close proximity, the development of the Sleepyhead Estate is projected to have a negligible or small positive social effect on early childhood education centres within the study area.

10. **PRIMARY AND SECONDARY EDUCATION SERVICES**

Context

- 10.1 Within the study area, all primary school principals were offered an interview, two Huntly school principals declined and five agreed. All three college principals were offered an interview and agreed.
- 10.2 Additional context about each of the schools is available from the author. The table below sets out the roll and ages taught (years) for each school.

School name	Years	Roll
Ohinewai School	1 to 8	152 (increasing)
Rangiriri Primary School	1 to 8	28 (increasing)
Te Kauwhata Primary	1 to 6	290 (slowly increasing, zoned)
Kimihia School (Huntly)	1 to 8	396 (increasing, zoned)
Te Kauwhata College	7 to 13	498 (slowly increasing)
Huntly College	9 to 15	200 (decreasing)
Te Wharekura Rakaumangamanga	0 1 to 13	435 (increasing)

Potential social effects on primary and secondary schools of working families moving or living in Te Kauwhata or Huntly

- 10.3 All principals were positive about the prospect of employees (of enterprises establishing in the Masterplan area) living in Huntly or Te Kauwhata. Even for schools where the roll was close to full, such as Te Kauwhata Primary and Kimihia School, the prospect of new families moving into the area was welcomed. Both saw it as a potential positive for the community, bringing employment to the parents and consequent flow on benefits to families, children and community. For the schools where there was capacity and desire to expand, again, principals welcomed the potential for new families to stabilize or grow rolls, alongside the potential social benefits from having a greater proportion of employed parents in the community.
- 10.4 Principals also commented on the potential for direct benefits for their students. This included the ability for students to grow up and live locally, rather than move from the area for work. The principal of Huntly College was excited about the hope the development offered her students. She said:

"These are good kids. All they want to do is get a job, earn some money and help their parents. This proposal gives them hope it can happen."

- 10.5 Te Kauwhata Primary said getting staff was becoming harder but was still achievable. For example, in the past they had 20 applicants for a role, and more recently just four. The principal hoped that with the influx of employees at the site, that there might be some teachers who also move into the area (as partners of those workers). Increasing the diversity of skills in the area from the incoming parents is also assessed to be highly likely as the predominant industry is currently agricultural. The incoming workers are likely to have a broad range of skills: From light industrial, commercial, and management. The partners of these workers are also likely to have a wide skill set. These people will be available to participate in school activities and for example, offer their skills to school boards.
- 10.6 Several principals also said that their parents were busy, many of whom commuted long distances to Hamilton or Auckland, with little time available for their family. In that respect, principals believed that having local work would be good for the children, parents, school and community.
- 10.7 The principal of Te Wharekura O Rakaumangamanga said that employment for local families would be warmly welcomed.
- 10.8 As discussed in Section 7, working families are expected to settle throughout the district, with a large proportion in Te Kauwhata, while others are expected to live in Hamilton and a small proportion in Huntly. Focusing on Te Kauwhata, therefore, about 200 migrant staff are projected to move there. The migrant staff would equate to about 40 children (at any one time). This is a modest number relative to the 10-year growth projections for the local schools (+500 students for Te Kauwhata College; and +700 students across two primary schools).

Potential social effects on primary schools of working families living at the Masterplan site

- 10.9 A second question to consider is where the workers/residents living at the Masterplan area might send their children for schooling. The 900-1,100 houses anticipated by the Masterplan are projected to house up to 2,797 residents, including 559 children under the age of 18 years. Divided by eighteen, this equates to 31 children per year group.
- 10.10 The two zoned primary schools (Kimihi School in Huntly and Te Kauwhata Primary) do not include Ohinewai in their zone, and so do not expect the children at the site to affect their schools.

- 10.11 St Anthony's Catholic School in Huntly does not expect a substantial increase in students from the site if the workforce is largely pakeha (as the proportion of Pakeha Catholics is low). St Anthony's only expect roll growth if there is a substantial migrant workforce. Regardless, the school has capacity and welcomed the opportunity to expand and teach more children, if required.
- 10.12 The principal of Rangiriri School would like the kura to grow. She believes the development has potential to stabilise the kura's fluctuating roll. As she points out, the families who work at the Masterplan site are far less likely to be transient and the proportion of Maori families who migrate into jobs is not known. Therefore, the final effect on the kura is assessed as small positive.
- 10.13 Ohinewai School is a full primary (years 1 to 8) and the proposed Masterplan site is within their existing enrolment zone. Taking a 'highest case' approach, if all children within the site attended Ohinewai School, this would equate to 248 additional children, on top of an existing roll of 152, potentially totalling 400. This is not an overly large roll for a primary school in New Zealand, with Balmoral primary's roll in Auckland at 908, and another 40 primary schools with a roll over 600. However, it is a substantial change, especially for a rural school. Despite this, the principal of Ohinewai School welcomes the growth of the school in the short and medium term, as the population of the site builds over time. The site visit confirmed ample greenspace for additional classrooms, though new classrooms would need to be sourced from the Ministry of Education. The principal has some concerns about the ability of the Ministry of Education to provide classrooms within a timely manner, though delays are usually measured in months and not years. Regarding the values and 'feel' of the school, the principal is confident the school can retain its rural character, especially if the western side of the Expressway remains rural living. This is also supported by the fact that the school is surrounded by greenspace, and the zone of the school will still be a predominantly rural area (even with the Masterplan). Despite looming issues with primary school teacher recruitment nationwide, Ohinewai School does not have a problem attracting staff to teach at the school. The potential for the school to get potable water and sewerage was strongly welcomed.
- 10.14 Long term, as the residential population of the Masterplan site grows, decisions on Ohinewai School zoning will be made by the Ministry of Education. As explained at paragraph 7.23 of David Gaze's statement of evidence, the Ministry's intention, after meeting with APL, and a phone call with myself, is to expand Ohinewai School to accommodate future students. This aligns with the assessor's experience from other, past impact assessments.

Potential social effects on secondary schools of working families living at the Masterplan site

- 10.15 Future effects on Te Kauwhata College and Huntly College, arising from the children of the residents potentially living at the Sleepyhead Estate, also depend on zoning decisions that will be made by the Ministry of Education. At present, neither college is zoned, meaning students from any geographic location can attend. Te Kauwhata College has substantial plans for growth (additional growth of over 500 students). Huntly College has substantial capacity for growth (over 500) based on past and current rolls. If both colleges remain un-zoned, it is assessed that parents living at the Sleepyhead Estate would choose Te Kauwhata College over Huntly College, unless/until confidence in Huntly College is restored. However, because secondary students will have to travel for either college regardless, all non-zoned schools within commuting distance become options, e.g. Hamilton Boys and Hamilton Girls.
- 10.16 It is therefore projected that Te Kauwhata College would attract about 70% of the students, and the balance would attend other schools in the region. This would equate to an additional 150 students at Te Kauwhata College, well within their 10-year growth projections (+500). The principal of Te Kauwhata College believes the school would be able to cope with growth from Ohinewai in the short to medium term, and further growth would be dependent on Te Kauwhata growth and Ministry of Education decisions.
- 10.17 However, if Te Kauwhata College is zoned, and Ohinewai is outside this zone, this has substantial implications for encouraging students toward Huntly College (Years 9 to 13), which would be welcomed by Huntly College. However, it is unlikely that the parents would be comfortable with such an arrangement and it is projected most would choose to send their secondary school children elsewhere, unless/until confidence in Huntly College is restored. The principal and senior leadership at Huntly College are attempting just that.
- 10.18 The principal of Te Wharekura O Rakaumangamanga described that unless a large proportion of the workforce migrating to the area had children who spoke te reo fluently, there would be little impact on the kura.
- 10.19 Te Kauwhata College, Huntly College and Te Wharekura O Rakaumangamanga all have transition to work programmes within their curricula. It is a substantial component of Huntly College's offering (called Gateway Programme) and is very well run. For example, at Huntly College, students undertake work experience for one day a week, get NCEA credits,

and show the employer they are work-ready. Te Wharekura O Rakaumangamanga also has a successful programme and is interested in working alongside NZ Comfort Group in a collaborative manner. The kura programmes include internships with ACC and Tainui Group, and placements at construction companies. The kura follows the career aspirations of students when deciding who to partner with. For Te Kauwhata College, there are few opportunities and so the programme is limited, and what is undertaken relies on a small number of businesses who can become 'overloaded'. Also, for some types of work experience, Te Kauwhata College students need to travel to Taupo and Rotorua, and it would be preferable to gain such experience locally. All principals welcome the opportunity to work with NZ Comfort Group and other employers, if the Masterplan is approved. *"Having more partnerships with employers, more employers for the kids to choose from would be fantastic."* (School principal)

- 10.20 For staff employed in the Ohinewai Structure Plan area who might move into the study area, the schools had good ERO reports and are examples of New Zealand's high-quality education system. The exception is Huntly College. The new principal, senior leaders and many in the community are working hard to win back the trust of their community. Any support they can receive is greatly appreciated. This project has the potential to provide further impetus to their efforts.

Overall assessment on potential social effects on primary and secondary education services

- 10.21 Overall, the assessment concludes the proposed development will potentially have a minor positive effect on primary schools in the study area. This arises from local families gaining employment, being able to work locally, spending more time with their family and in their community (and school). A potential moderate positive effect is also projected to arise from Sleepyhead Estate families migrating into communities, bringing their diverse skills and resources to schools and the wider communities. For primary schools where roll growth is desired, the families moving into the area has the potential to help stabilize and grow rolls.
- 10.22 For Ohinewai School, when taking a 'highest case' assessment, their roll has the potential to grow from 152 to either 300 or 400 (depending on zoning decisions). The principal and deputy-principal are positive about the Masterplan and the opportunities that it offers the school, students and community. They believe the rural character of Ohinewai School will be maintained and they welcome the short to medium term growth for the

school. They look forward to benefiting from the potable water and sewage system. The principal is wary about potential delays for new classrooms, though delays are measured in months not years. The Ministry of Education has signalled their preference is to grow Ohinewai School. As such, the potential social effect on Ohinewai School is assessed as moderate positive.

10.23 Secondary school principals also recognized the direct benefits for their students, offering hope and providing opportunities to students to work and live locally once they become adults. Similar to primary school principals, secondary principals also see substantial benefit to parents, students and the wider community arising from the opportunity for parents to live and work locally, rather than spend their time on long commutes. Such potential outcomes are supported by literature and align with the Waikato Blueprint. Therefore, the potential effect on all secondary schools is assessed as moderate positive due to the potential relationships with employers for transition to work programmes. Potential roll growth at Huntly College and Te Wharekura O Rakaumangamanga arising from the Masterplan is projected to be small. Roll growth at Te Kauwhata College is projected to be about 150 students, well within the 10-year growth plans for the College (+500). The principal of Te Kauwhata College welcomes the Masterplan.

11. **CHILDREN'S VOICE**

11.1 To bring a children's voice to the assessment, the principal of Ohinewai School supported the request of the assessor to hold a session with eight students. The children were different ages, some living locally, some from Te Kauwhata and some from Huntly. The children were free to express *'what the Masterplan meant to them'*. Children were invited to draw, write or do both (on an A3 sheet) and their drawings were discussed with their classmates. The children's drawings are available from the author.

11.2 The children expressed many of the same themes as adults. The predominant themes were the positive effects arising from employment and housing. Comments included: *'Job for me; People get jobs and homes; I could live here when I'm older; More people will have houses; Our family could live closer'*, etc. One additional theme emerged, not previously identified by adults: *'We need to put in places to occupy everyone, like retirement homes.'*

11.3 The consequent effect on an increased population, and how that might affect themselves and others, was also common in the children's responses: *'There would be more kids to come to our school; Heaps of people will make new friends and be more social; Schools shut down if they get under-populated.'*

- 11.4 Five of the eight students were explicit the development must not pollute the environment. This mirrored similar concerns from a small number of adults, but was far more prominent with the children.
- 11.5 The children were excited by the potential retail development and saw the potential for greater recreational opportunities for themselves and others.
- 11.6 Potential negative effects identified by the children included: *'It might affect the farm next to Ohinewai; Won't this cause more traffic. Yes, more houses more cars; There would be lots of traffic and industrial commotion.'*
- 11.7 For one child, the development would mean they would have to move to a new house. Their drawing focussed almost solely on this outcome. Despite this substantial life event, the child drew a smiley face on themselves in their picture. Asked how moving to a new house made them feel, they said they were 'OK.'
- 11.8 Unprompted, six children summed up their overall feeling for the Masterplan in their drawings: *'I support this development; I support them; I'm kinda in the middle of supporting it; I think it would be good because many others can get jobs. I think it is a good idea to build this township. For a brighter future; I think it should happen; I want this development to go through.'*
- 11.9 Overall, this assessment concludes the Masterplan will have a moderate positive effect on the local children. The children clearly articulated how the Masterplan would lead to positive effects for themselves and others related to employment, housing, an increased population, retail, and recreational opportunities.

12. **BUSINESS**

Context

- 12.1 Within the study area (Huntly, Ohinewai, Rangiriri, Te Kauwhata and regional), 39 business specific interviews were held with retailers, wholesalers, light industrial businesses, hospitality, banks, real estate agents, health businesses and education businesses.
- 12.2 Huntly is the predominant service town in the study area. It has a substantial employment base, though declining, as can be seen from the following Census data:
- (a) At the 2013 Census there were 73 business locations in Huntly West. This is a decrease of 21 percent from 2006. There were 660 paid

employees in Huntly West. This is a decrease of 23 per cent from 2006. The predominant businesses are power generation (330), education (170), health and social services (80) and mining (25).

- (b) At the 2013 Census there were 346 business locations in Huntly East. This is a decrease of 8 per cent from 2006. There were 1,500 paid employees in Huntly East. This is a similar number of employees from the year ended February 2006. The predominant businesses are Retail (240), manufacturing (200), mining (180), health (170), and accommodation and food services (150).

12.3 Participants reflected the same, saying that employment was greatly needed in Huntly, and the predominant employers were the Huntly power station, mining, manufacturing and retail. Many participants were adamant Huntly was 'not a shopping destination', with many describing the main street as made up of (mostly) food outlets, followed by pharmacies, real estate agents and banks. The food outlets are supported by local workers at breakfast and lunchtime, and by Huntly locals throughout the day (who have no need/desire to drive further for a food outlet). Drive-through traffic (from State Highway 1) were not described as key customers by food businesses on the main street, which matches with Huntly being described as 'not a retail destination'. Participants described how people from around the District already travelled to Hamilton or Auckland for a shopping destination. The exception is Countdown supermarket, which is the largest of three supermarkets in the surrounding area (until reaching Hamilton (Te Rapa) or Pukekohe). Real Estate Agents in Huntly described a large proportion of new people moving into Huntly commute to Hamilton or Auckland for employment, and consequently shop there as well.

12.4 In contrast to Huntly, Te Kauwhata is far smaller, and business numbers are also declining. There were 134 business locations in Te Kauwhata in 2013. This is a decrease of 8 percent from 2006. There were 370 paid employees, a decrease of 12 percent from 2006. The predominant industries are education and training (90), health and social care (80) and manufacturing (45). The main street is small, consisting of food outlets, real estate agents and small retail outlets. The Te Kauwhata Tavern has a prominent position on the main street. Te Kauwhata locals also travel to work at the nearby Springhill Prison and many of the newer residents' commute to Auckland for employment, and consequently shop there as well.

12.5 Rangiriri is smaller again with just the Rangiriri Hotel, adjacent café and cultural centre, and a light manufacturing business.

- 12.6 Ohinewai has two medium-size employers: Max Birt Sawmills with 100 staff/contractors; and Lumbercorp with up to 50 staff. Ceracell is also adjacent to these two businesses and has 15 staff. Across the Waikato Expressway, Compac Homes has 30 staff and contractors on their Ohinewai North Road site. Given the resident population of Ohinewai CAUs is 152, a workforce of 195 is boxing well above its weight, equivalent to half the workforce of Te Kauwhata which has a population ten times the size (1,473 people).

Potential social effects on business

- 12.7 Business owners were overwhelmingly positive about the potential development, irrespective of type of business or location. Business owners believed the development would support Huntly businesses by potentially providing employment for local people. Business owners could see that Huntly businesses had the potential to benefit via increased local spending from having more employed families in the town. A few businesses believed the development had potential to provide hope and encourage investment in the town centre, into businesses other than food outlets. Similarly, it was believed that many of the people who have moved to Huntly recently (and work in Auckland/Hamilton) might work at Ohinewai in the future. Businesses described the potential benefit of local people living and working locally, increasing the likelihood of spending locally too. *"You can't spend money here if you're sitting on the Auckland motorway"* (Huntly business owner). *"People commute to Hamilton for work as a first choice; Auckland as a second choice. If there're local jobs, people will jump at them"* (Regional interviewee). This finding is supported by Section 6 of Mr Heath's evidence..
- 12.8 Interviewees did not see Huntly as a 'retail destination'. Many participants described that locals and people in the District already travelled outside the District for shopping, and those people would continue to do so. In contrast, business owners described that some people don't shop around, and/or people needed their goods in a hurry, and/or people preferred to shop local. Business owners said such people would keep supporting them.
- 12.9 Countdown Supermarket (Huntly) expects a continued increase in online shopping, and the physical store has capacity for substantial growth (per week sales), should that be required. This is important since they are the nearest supermarket to Ohinewai, and no supermarket is proposed.
- 12.10 Huntly business owners were confident in their business models, with most having more than one channel for sales. For example, Placemakers Huntly has a modest retail space but a large yard. Hence most of their revenue is

supplying yard orders for Hamilton clients. The opportunities for further deliveries to Ohinewai, should the Masterplan proceed, were considered positive by the Placemakers interviewee. Similarly, Resene Paints in Huntly has a small retail space, but also has a sizeable painting business attached (20 staff). It is looking forward to the development as the owner said: *'We'd hope to paint some of that.'* While their retail space is small, Resene Paints felt well supported by Huntly businesses and locals and expected that to continue. BUILTsmart is a medium size company, growing fast, which prefabricates houses. They are hiring staff in the existing labour pool, typically direct from trade tech short courses or through word of mouth. As with other businesses, BUILTsmart were highly positive about the Masterplan and its potential employment benefits for Huntly. *"This is great news for our business. It's great news for Huntly"* (Huntly business owner).

- 12.11 Business owners were also positive about the labour pool in Huntly. While owners acknowledged there were *'some slackers about'*, they said that most people wanted to work and if paid well and *'given a mission'*, are great workers.
- 12.12 Huntly businesses also saw the potential for the development to change the perception and attitudes about Huntly, especially for those who complete their studies at secondary school, and those who have the inner motivation to work. For these people (who are the majority), the Masterplan was seen to offer hope: *"Aim to change those people that can be changed, the mid-range people. There will always be those who want to fish all day, do drugs or sit on the couch. They're too hard to shift. But by offering hope, and offering pre-apprentice opportunities, this development could be massive for this District"* (Te Kauwhata interviewee).
- 12.13 For those people for whom it is difficult to place in employment, and stay in employment, participants acknowledged the deep set issues faced: Intergenerational dependence, drug use, ability to pass drug testing in workplaces, alcohol, mental health issues, violence, unreliability, lack of skills e.g. no drivers licence or restricted licence, etc. For such people, *'providing jobs in the District'* was not the biggest barrier to them gaining employment. Instead, collaborative approaches are required, but these are beyond the scope of this report or the Masterplan. *"It will stimulate Huntly by providing jobs for local people. We'll have more resources to help those who need more help"* (Regional Interviewee).
- 12.14 Regional interviewees and business interviewees described how Huntly East has issues regarding a lack of land that can be zoned industrial, which are

compounded by potential subsidence issues, flood risk, and the geographical constraints of the hills and river. Te Kauwhata is similar, hemmed in by the Whangamarino wetlands, river and lake, and already consented housing, meaning little chance to expand for light industrial land. As such, many interviewees described the Masterplan as potentially providing a real movement forward for the district, Huntly and Te Kauwhata. Section 4 of Mr Heath's evidence supports this notion. The social consequences of such industrial zoning offer potential employment to Te Kauwhata (rather than remaining a dormitory suburb for Auckland), and expands employment opportunities for the Huntly population. This is particularly important given the decline in businesses in Huntly and Te Kauwhata between censuses. *"To get prosperity for the district we need more industrial land."* *"The land that could be zoned industrial in Huntly is pretty limited, and that'll be swallowed up real quick."* (Regional interviewee). *"The people of Te Kauwhata didn't want industrial land here."* (Te Kauwhata interviewee). *"More manufacturing in the district will be good. We need this"* (Huntly business owner).

12.15 The same type of comments were noted from Te Kauwhata businesses. Businesses could see the benefit from locals being employed, but just as importantly for Te Kauwhata, from an influx of people into the Te Kauwhata housing developments. Business owners were *'waiting patiently'* for the growth that has been forecast for Te Kauwhata and not eventuated. They see the Masterplan as a potential catalyst to achieve the growth that is already forecast (and not yet arrived). They also believed that because these people would live and work locally, the families would be more likely to contribute to their businesses, and the social structures of the town. As such, business owners were highly supportive of the Masterplan with its associated employment. These responses were often given in contrast to the housing-led development in Te Kauwhata, which was seen in a negative light. Participants reflected that most of the new people moving into the area were commuters and most contribute little to local businesses or community. This is reflected in the Census data showing the number of businesses declining, despite population growth. *"The housing developments have slowed or stopped. It's a real mess to be honest. Not only that, but the developers were after the cheapest price and cut a lot of local businesses out of the work. It's left a real sour taste in our mouth"* (Te Kauwhata interviewee).

12.16 For Ohinewai, all four major businesses were interviewed. One was neutral on the Masterplan (Lumbercorp), while the other three were supportive. Max Birt Sawmills was also interested in how any road realignment might affect their truck movements (4,000 one-way movements per year). Neither Compac Homes or Ceracell predicted any material effect on their business.

All three were supportive of the proposed development due to the potential benefits they saw for Ohinewai, Huntly and the District arising from employment.

- 12.17 The Rangiriri Hotel did not foresee an effect on their trade as most was from people passing through. The Rangiriri Café, Cultural and Heritage Centre is predominantly a tourist business, based around the historic Rangiriri Pa. They see the potential for a small uplift in their café as it offers high quality food and service. Both establishments were positive about the potential employment for the District. The interviewees at the Rangiriri Café, Cultural and Heritage Centre were adamant the environment must be looked after.
- 12.18 Overall, this assessment concludes the proposed Masterplan will potentially have a major positive effect on local businesses, especially within the context of past decreases in businesses in these towns.

13. **HEALTH, SOCIAL AND COMMUNITY SERVICES**

Context

- 13.1 Within the study area (Huntly, Ohinewai, Te Kauwhata and regional), interviews were held with 18 service providers, including Police, fire, medical, dental, iwi, community agencies, MSD, St John, etc. Context data on these services is available from the author.

Potential social effects for health and social services

- 13.2 For St John Ambulance, if the development was just going to be an industrial area, any effect on ambulance services would be minimal. In contrast, the housing would potentially have an effect, especially as there are projected to be young children (from the working families), who generate greater use of ambulance services. However, St John Ambulance believe any additional need would be easily met by existing services using their fluid deployment model. The station in Huntly operates 24/7. All stations are expanding their services and have substantial capacity for further expansion again. The need for an ambulance station in Ohinewai is therefore assessed to be highly unlikely in the short- and medium-term.
- 13.3 For Police services, the Area Commander believes the Huntly Police station has capacity to cover the growth expected from the Masterplan. This is because of the growth in Police numbers scheduled for the Waikato Region over the next five years, and the ability to direct that resource where required. The expanding capacity at Te Kauwhata station would also be

available to act as cover, if required. The need for a Police station in Ohinewai in the short- or medium-term is therefore assessed to be unlikely.

- 13.4 For health services, the four GP services within Huntly have capacity within their roll to deal with the slow growth in population expected in Ohinewai. The two multi-site GP practices in Huntly, and Te Kauwhata Health Centre have all expressed interest in understanding more about the Masterplan. For all three, there is potential to open a satellite clinic, running selected hours to begin with, until the population expands. Short-term, there is capacity at the Huntly clinics for Ohinewai residents. Long-term, as GP services are delivered from the Masterplan site, development from the Masterplan is more likely to result in maintenance of GP rolls in Huntly and Te Kauwhata, rather than expansion.
- 13.5 For Birthcare Huntly, the development would not have an immediate influx on their service as population growth at the site is expected to occur over time. Longer term, because the site is expected to attract families, Birthcare Huntly welcomed future growth. Birthcare Huntly said they would accommodate any growth by moving building ('there's lots of empty buildings in town') but they'd only do that if growth in the services required was clear.
- 13.6 For social service providers, Te Kauwhata Community House are expecting substantial population growth in Te Kauwhata from the consented housing subdivisions. Like others, they have noticed the growth has not yet materialised to the projected levels. They do not expect any substantial growth in their services from the Masterplan beyond what is already projected for Te Kauwhata already.
- 13.7 The Ministry of Social Development welcomes the prospect of working alongside NZ Comfort Group. They see substantial potential for assisting people from around the District into employment. Transition to work schemes with local schools are supported, as well as other angles to address those children not in school. Agencies to connect with include Waikato District Council, Matahuru marae, iwi, Youth Justice and Oranga Tamariki.
- 13.8 For Matahuru Papakainga Marae, the marae AGM discussed the Masterplan and showed support for the project. Important aspects to consider were ensuring no environmental effects on land, air and waterways; and the need for housing and employment. The housing and employment objectives of the Matahuru Papakainga Marae and the Masterplan align well i.e. the two have shared aims. Discussions between APL and the marae about these topics have been occurring since inception. The marae welcomes the continuation

of these discussions to identify how best to jointly meet these shared aims. The marae also supported the Masterplan because it was a NZ company with social values. They believed that if this development was not undertaken by APL, the next developer who seeks to develop the land may not be so favourable to their goals of employment and housing.

13.9 For Waahi Whaanui (a large social service provider), Ohinewai is within their geographic scope. Because their services are contracted by central government agencies and DHBs, it is projected that any increase in demand would be addressed via these population-based contracts. Waahi Whaanui see strong potential positive effects arising from the employment opportunities. However, the interviewee cautioned that gaining employment for a previously troubled individual does not remove other risks faced. The interviewee suggested a wrap-around scheme for young people employed, to help keep them employed.

13.10 As a general comment: health, social services and emergency participants were highly supportive of the proposed development due to the potential employment benefits to the District. All commented on the potential flow-on effects arising from partners of workers into the area (and the workers themselves) supporting the work that they do: Be that as employees or volunteers.

13.11 Overall, this assessment concludes the proposed development will have a neutral effect on health and emergency services, and potentially a minor positive effect on social services.

14. **LUMSDEN ROAD AND TAHUNA ROAD RESIDENTS**

Context

14.1 The following houses were door-knocked and invited to interview:

(a) Tahuna Road (corner of Lumsden Road to corner of Frost Road, both sides of road)

(b) Lumsden Road (numbers 41 to 85, 52 to 58, i.e. both sides of road opposite the site).

14.2 Those with roaming dogs, or those not home were left a letter inviting them to arrange an interview time with the assessor. Eight in-person interviews with residents were held. From the letter-drop, two additional phone interviews were undertaken.

14.3 Further context information about this area is available from the author.

Potential social effects on Lumsden Road and Tahuna Road residents

14.4 None of the three interviewees on the western side of Lumsden Road (covering five properties) were opposed to the development. Some people on that side of Lumsden Road may be against the development, just that no one was home during door knocking, and nor were letter-drops responded to. Therefore, potential negative social effects have been judged by the assessor's experience, and through interviews with those residents who were supportive (but were accepting of the potential negative effects). The main potential negative relates to the rural outlook of sites to the east. This view would change to a view of massed plantings, which while not unpleasant, is different to the current easterly views. Northerly, southerly and easterly views would not change for most of the residents on the western side of Lumsden Road. Two residents were concerned about any potential effects on their water bores, and requested monitoring, and remediation, if the bore is affected. Agreements have been signed to this effect.

14.5 Residents on the western side have been contacted by APL about the development, and several have signed a written approval as potentially affected persons. Several residents support the development and the progress it would represent. This support was given with the knowledge their rural outlook would change, there would be an increase in the number of people, and the 'hustle and bustle' the development would bring. Residents understood there would be more trucks on Lumsden Road but were hopeful of a substantially reduced speed limit past their homes. The consequent potential social effects arising from additional truck movements is assessed as low due to the constraining effects already present from existing truck movements.

14.6 Due to the proposed street layout of the Masterplan, Lumsden Road will be unlikely to see substantial domestic traffic from future residents of the site.

14.7 I discussed the Ohinewai Masterplan with the residents on the eastern side of Lumsden Road who advised they were in negotiation with APL representatives about the purchase of their properties. As I understand it, without prejudice discussions are ongoing.

14.8 Most Tahuna Road properties are beyond the DOC land, heading east along Tahuna Road. Only 166 and 282 Tahuna Road are east of the DOC land (and therefore closer to the development). Both households were invited to interview but did not take up the offer. As such, the five Tahuna Road

interviewees were between one and two kilometres from the south-east corner of the development.

14.9 Of the five interviewees on Tahuna Road, four were neutral towards the development. They foresaw little effect because of the distance to the development, or their current way of life being a farm worker. The prospect of shops and petrol nearby was appealing for some, while others had not thought much about the potential effects of the development beyond their home being less isolated. The fifth person was strongly against '*linear growth along corridors*' which he believed the Masterplan would enable. The interviewee was also concerned about the '*need to spread out the people*' who might buy the housing proposed for the site. Despite reassurances by the assessor that the residents of the Sleepyhead Estate would be employed, the interviewee maintained his concerns. The respondent also preferred the applicant put the development in Huntly, Te Kauwhata or Hamilton; and said there was ample housing in those townships as well. The assessor has addressed these comments within other sections of this evidence.

14.10 Overall, this assessment concludes that the development has the potential for a neutral to minor negative effect on Lumsden Road residents (western side of road). These residents will experience social effects arising from the change of their rural outlook (to the east only) to massed plantings.

14.11 For Lumsden Road residents (eastern side), if their properties are not purchased the potential social effects are judged to be minor negative for Lumsden road residents (eastern side) because of changes in their immediate living environment. If their properties are purchased, the purchase is assessed to result in a potential minor negative social effect because the residents will need to resettle elsewhere, although the residents themselves are likely to see that effect as being offset by the financial compensation of purchase.

15. **COMMUNITY WAY OF LIFE**

15.1 As set out in Section 4 (Approach and methodology) it was considered important to understand how the development might affect issues such as way of life and aspirations for the future. These issues have been touched upon throughout the document and this section draws them together into one place.

Ohinewai

- 15.2 Ohinewai is a historic settlement that was once thriving with a blacksmith, two butchers, post office, café/shop, service station, etc. The advent of the motorcar meant that people travelled for services; and then the road bypassed the village, leading to the eventual closure of all services. It is now rural living, with a community made up of people who are more likely to be older than younger. Interviewees described the village as 'low key; very white; not a lot of families.' Some residents visit other residents regularly, others do not. Facility-wise, there is a tennis club and a hall. Interviewees were adamant that Ohinewai was not Huntly, and while they appreciated APL's attempts to be outward-looking and inclusive, they wanted everyone to be clear that Huntly and Ohinewai are separate settlements.
- 15.3 Interviewees said the cost of using the hall is kept low to encourage use, and consequently the hall is used two out of every three days. The upkeep of the hall is funded via a council-owned piece of land on the eastern side of the Expressway (the domain) which is leased (for stock use). That land is about to be de-stocked and the \$14,000 annual funding used for the upkeep of the hall will cease. Another source of income is required. Traffic volumes on the western side of the Expressway are far less than those on the eastern side (where the sawmill and Lumbercorp businesses are). Lumsden Road is a dead end at the northern end, meaning all truck traffic must come south, down Lumsden Road. Lumsden Road interviewees (western side of road) perceived the Masterplan would mean little change to the way they lived their life. *'There's not much to affect is there'* (Lumsden Road resident, western side of road). For those Lumsden Road residents (eastern side), they felt they would likely have to move. Tahuna Road residents were also asked how it would affect their way of life. They foresaw little effect because of the distance to the development (up to 2.5km away), or their current way of life being a farm worker. The prospect of shops and petrol nearby was appealing for some, while others had not thought much about the potential effects of the development beyond their home being less isolated.
- 15.4 The Ohinewai community (west of Expressway) wishes to continue its country living aspirations, with large lot size developments. They see the Masterplan as a major departure from this, but if country living was retained on the western side, interviewees were 'OK' with the Masterplan. This is reinforced where interviewees described how traffic volumes (on the western side) would determine how the community sees itself, because at present there was little industrial traffic. This coincides with the concern of industrial land also being zoned on the western side of the Expressway. If industrial

land became common on both sides of the Expressway, interviewees perceived loss of their rural living. Interviewees listed several positive outcomes: *'Big boon for jobs for people, especially if they can hire locally; Water, sewerage, fibre; Better connections for pedestrians and cyclists across SH1 are welcomed; House prices will increase; Opportunities for small businesses, entrepreneurs will flourish; Bike lane to Huntly; Previous clubs like cricket have closed but might reopen. Will support the few existing clubs e.g. tennis; Love the market garden idea'*. In support of this assessment, the Section 42A report recommends that land west of the Expressway is not zoned industrial.

- 15.5 Interviewees were interested in how air quality and leachate (contamination of groundwater and soil) would be managed. There was a general concern that once consent was granted, environmental conditions might not be monitored appropriately. Interviewees believe Council is ill-equipped to deal with such compliance.

Huntly

- 15.6 Huntly was a bustling coal mining town, further buoyed by the coal-fired power station, but there has since been a substantial downturn in those industries. Nearly everyone spoken to, whether from Huntly or not, acknowledged deep-set issues arising from gangs, drugs, alcohol, unemployment and poverty. Substantial negative perceptions of Huntly exist, despite people also acknowledging that there are some nicer areas. *'Ohinewai's OK. Huntly, oh, ah, yeah, what can I say. Not so much.'*
- 15.7 However, Huntly is seen to *'have better services, supermarket, KFC, more shops than Te Kauwhata'*, though it is not considered a *'shopping destination'*. Huntly is also attracting commuters, due to housing being substantially less expensive than Te Kauwhata. However, Huntly locals are beginning to describe it as a dormitory town. Combined with the contraction of businesses that is occurring and the Expressway bypass, the shops and services in the Huntly are in an increasingly precarious position. Similarly, sports clubs have declining memberships and most services/facilities have substantial spare capacity. The development has the potential to at least partially rectify this, by providing people in Huntly with employment. The following quotes express this:
- (a) *'With the Expressway bypassing Huntly people are worried we'll drop a bit, but this has the potential to surpass that. This will bring jobs to people in Huntly. It'll attract workers to live here and that'll be great'* (Huntly Community Board member).

- (b) *'Recently there's been a lot of new people buying houses. That's all good, but about half of those are commuting away for work, travelling to Hamilton, Pokeno, South Auckland'* (Huntly bank manager).
- (c) *'Given the culture The Comfort Group talk about, their wraparound values, it will benefit our disadvantaged people to get employment. It'll raise the standard of living. People will feel value in themselves and in our community. It will help to rectify some of the negative aspects of our community. We love the whanau aspect of it'* (Huntly Community Board member).
- (d) *'It's not an insular development, not like so many others. It's inclusive of the surrounding areas. It's so refreshing'* (Huntly Community Board member).

15.8 Public transport from Huntly to job markets is poor. Combined with the fact that many jobseekers do not have a driver's licence, a public transport link between Huntly and the Masterplan site is seen as essential by several interviewees. This would also mean the Ohinewai Masterplan site could become an extension of Huntly's industrial land, and a source of industrial land for Te Kauwhata.

Te Kauwhata

15.9 Te Kauwhata is a rural township with aspirations for substantial residential growth. It is regarded as *'a good place to live'*. As one resident said: *'This town is growing, it's getting bigger all the time.'* Interviewees described how a few townspeople, especially those older, have some trepidation about the unknown nature of the towns projected growth. This was countered by the statement *'that if you weren't interested in growth, you're in the wrong town'* and *'people here have a growth mindset already.'*

15.10 The way of life described by interviewees was one of change. *'There's no typical way of life here anymore, we have different people doing different things.'* In the past Te Kauwhata was a rural village. However, one of the earlier housing developments *'got into trouble post-GFC, faced big losses and rented to undesirable tenants in the meantime.'* This issue has abated as commuters (to Auckland, Hamilton, staff at Spring Hill prison) have slowly purchased housing, but it is fresh in people's minds and likely influences some people's thoughts about the Ohinewai Masterplan.

15.11 The commuter-base is relatively new. Commuters are attracted to Te Kauwhata because the housing is more affordable than Auckland and Hamilton. Interviewees described how the many commuters made it harder for businesses to set up because people are not here during the daytime: *'They just sleep here.'* Commuting also affected the time parents had for their children, and time to devote to community activities. Interviewees believed that the Huntly section of the Waikato Expressway would increase the number of commuters in Te Kauwhata due to the decreased time to drive to/from Hamilton. This culminated in a modest collection of shops on the main street. Interviewees often said there was little work locally, and others noted the lack of industrial land in and around Te Kauwhata. Comments from Te Kauwhata interviewees reflect the above:

- (a) *'We don't have the employment to support the number of houses consented. We're reliant on industrial and retail elsewhere.'*
- (b) *'Our biggest export is our young people. All of my kids have moved to get work.'*
- (c) *'Te Kauwhata had no interest in zoning land industrial. They wanted housing and that's what they've got.'*

15.12 Despite the township recently moving towards becoming a dormitory suburb, it has a long history of volunteering and social connections. This is seen in the two Lions' clubs, rugby, golf, cricket, netball, squash, bowls, book, darts, pool, brownies and scouts, patchwork and quilting, community gym and well regarded primary and secondary schools. Initially, Ohinewai residents may well swell these numbers while waiting for a critical mass in Ohinewai itself. Interviewees in Te Kauwhata welcomed the opportunity to support Ohinewai residents as they Masterplan develops over time.

15.13 Regarding people's overarching impression of the Masterplan, it was summed up by this comment: *'Oh my god the jobs would be amazing. The houses in TK would sell, people would work close. It's an amazing prospect.'*

Summary of potential effects on community way of life

15.14 Overall, this assessment concludes that the proposed development will have a potential positive social effect on the western side of Ohinewai, providing future zoning decisions support aspirations for rural living on that side of the Expressway and environmental compliance is managed. For residents on Lumsden Road (western side), there would potentially be a neutral effect as they perceive little change to how they would live their life. For Lumsden

Road residents (eastern side) there would be a potential minor negative effect because they believe they will have to move.

15.15 For Huntly, the development is projected to complement the community's aspirations. The development is assessed to provide a source of hope regarding local employment and business confidence. This would be particularly true for those who are currently unemployed or under employed. Appropriate public transport is required for much of the employment benefit to accrue.

15.16 For Te Kauwhata, the Masterplan is projected to complement the community's growth aspirations by providing a source of employment for people who might purchase within the substantial subdivisions already consented. Being locally employed, these people have the potential to contribute positively to Te Kauwhata, supporting the existing, well-formed social structures.

16. **COMMENT ON ISSUES RAISED BY SUBMITTERS**

16.1 Several submissions from residents of Lumsden Road have raised concerns about the effects of the proposal on their way of life. In respect of those submissions, I reassert the following:

(a) Those living on the western side of Lumsden Road do not live in a typical rural environment. I refer to paragraphs 14.4 to 14.11 of my evidence which assesses a neutral to minor negative effect on Lumsden Road residents (western side). For Lumsden Road residents (eastern side), the potential purchase of their properties is judged to lead to a minor negative social effect because the residents will need to resettle elsewhere but this is judged by the residents themselves to be offset by the financial compensation of purchase. If not purchased, the social effects are judged to be moderate negative for Lumsden road residents (eastern side) because of changes in their immediate living environment.

(b) Regarding a potential lack of 'entertainment' or social services, no small town can offer that which is available in urban centres. But it is similarly difficult for urban centres to offer small town benefits such as live-work options, short drive times, ease of access to the outdoors, and the quality of social connections that can come from living in a smaller community. In my interviews with people from Te Kauwhata, it became clear the township has a long history of volunteering and social connections. This is seen in the two Lions'

clubs, rugby, golf, cricket, netball, squash, bowls, book, darts, pool, brownies and scouts, patchwork and quilting, community gym and well regarded primary and secondary schools. Huntly is similarly rich in opportunities. Initially, Ohinewai residents may well swell these numbers while waiting for a critical mass in Ohinewai itself. Interviewees in Te Kauwhata and Huntly welcomed the opportunity to support Ohinewai residents as they Masterplan develops over time. Social services are well provided in the nearby towns of Te Kauwhata and Huntly, and over time these are highly likely to open in Ohinewai, as evidenced by the willingness of existing providers to already suggest this is something they are interested in.

- (c) Ultimately the market will decide whether people will wish to live and work at Sleepyhead Estate. However, several key drivers are in favour of a positive outcome:
- (i) The prospect of a newly built home, near to work, with good access to open spaces and community facilities will be very appealing to people. To other people, who want older stock housing on larger sections, they will purchase elsewhere. That is OK too.
 - (ii) While NZ Comfort Group is the anchor tenant, a further 1000 jobs are projected to be created by other businesses, therefore spreading any risk of failure across many businesses
 - (iii) There is an acknowledged shortage of industrial land in the Waikato District, so in the unlikely event the NZ Comfort Group goes out of business, the land would remain desirable to other businesses due to its location within the Golden Triangle, and alongside State Highway 1 and the main trunk rail line.
 - (iv) There is an acknowledged shortfall of residential housing in the Waikato district, even with a fully built residential component to Sleepyhead Estate. Also, basic market dynamics identify that housing can be built at a rate which meets the market, just as it is done in other parts of the Waikato District.
 - (v) One of the main reasons for The Comfort Group choosing this site is the desire to support their own staff into some of the

housing, and they will be some of the first settlers to the area. Ironically, Waikato District is attempting to attract just such families because of their many positive social contributions to society.

- (vi) To be worried about a worst-case scenario is a fair human reaction to change, but the evidence shows housing and land fundamentals strongly work against the potential of Sleepyhead Estate becoming 'a slum'. Instead, the potential social outcomes are projected to be the opposite: A vibrant and desirable location for people to live, learn, work and play.

17. **COMMENT ON COUNCIL OFFICER'S REPORT AND EXPERT CONFERENCING**

17.1 Section 9 of the Council's Section 42A report says the APL proposal '*... poses significant social and transport issues.*' Their rationale is that the settlement is not large enough to be a fully functioning town. The Masterplan has never claimed to create a fully functioning town. In contrast, a rigorous, evidence-based SIA has reached the conclusion that the Masterplan provides an appropriate level of social infrastructure for a settlement of that size, and like all small towns can draw on the social infrastructure in the surrounding area.

17.2 The Council's report is informed by the peer review of the SIA by Beca. The following paragraphs outline how the concerns raised by Beca are unfounded.

17.3 The Beca peer review raises the following related issues:

- (a) '*... the assessment appears only to be based on the full implementation of the Masterplan outcomes*' (Page 1, point 3a).
- (b) The SIA assessed the Masterplan and as such the '*social service, infrastructure, housing, employment and community outcomes relied on in the SIA are not assured*' (Page 1, point 1);
- (c) The SIA should assess '*... the potential social effects of the rezoning without those aspects of the Masterplan that rely on delivery from third parties (beyond APL) ...*' (Page 1, second-to-last paragraph)

17.4 These statements underpin the majority of Beca’s concerns with the SIA and are repeated throughout the review in different ways. These concerns were also the focus of discussion during expert conferencing.

17.5 Their concerns, as outlined in the Joint Witness Statement (“JWS”), are underpinned by (in their opinion) a lack of certainty in the delivery of the social infrastructure.

17.6 During the course of expert conferencing it was agreed that: ⁵

‘Assessing other scenarios or scenarios where less of the master plan is implemented would have the potential to reduce effects identified in this assessment’ and ‘that assessing alternative scenarios is complex and further assessment is required before being able to draw any conclusions for the other scenarios.’

17.7 The expert conferencing participants also agreed:⁶

‘... that it is important that the development of social infrastructure is matched to the proposed staging of the development and that the district plan provisions are robust in ensuring that this is achieved.’

To address this, planning provisions for the social infrastructure are now proposed, as set out in the evidence of John Olliver.

17.8 This therefore prevents the need to break the potential change (in this case the Masterplan) into ‘clumps’ and assess each separately. Simply, this would be based on multiple assumptions, dilute consequent potential effects and increase the likelihood of finding neutral impacts. For data collection, data would need to be collected on each scenario and so the demand on stakeholders would be substantial. Overall, this approach would provide little assistance to decision makers.

17.9 As described by NZ’s Nick Taylor in the original social impact assessment guide⁷, trying to assess all possible outcomes is fruitless:

“It should be clear that social assessment does not involve a research process in the strict definition of the term. That is, formal hypotheses are not posed to see if they find support in the data. Instead, projections are made based on data and procedures that are seen to be sufficiently reasonable and convincing for others to agree on their plausibility. But these are projections about futures for which one can never be sure. The ‘future’ will keep changing as people react to the project or plans in their attempts to

5 Joint Witness Statement of Experts in relation to Social Impacts, 23 June 2020, Section 3.

6 Ibid.

7 (Taylor CN, Bryan CH and Goodrich CG (2004). Social assessment: Theory, process and techniques. Social Ecology Press).

enhance the outcomes and minimise the costs for themselves and others."

Recommendations for conditions

- 17.10 Beca says the SIA has a 'lack of recommendations for conditions (e.g. provisions of the rezoning), mitigation, or monitoring' (Page 1, Point 2.b)
- 17.11 Following the JWS, provisions for staging social infrastructure have now been outlined in the evidence of Mr Olliver. Furthermore, the SIA has not identified any potential negative effects of significance. Simply, conditions, mitigation and monitoring are therefore not required. It would be extremely unusual to suggest such measures when no significant negative effects have been identified.

Independence of my assessment

- 17.12 Beca says '*There is a strong reliance on the views expressed by stakeholders and individuals interviewed ... a clear independent expert assessment*' is lacking (Page 1, point 3b)
- 17.13 I am a social impact assessment expert. I am independent. And yes, I draw evidence from stakeholders, who are a legitimate and critical source of information about potential social effects. This includes the views of specialist Ministry of Education staff who work on school infrastructure and the Principal and Deputy Principal of Ohinewai School (See page 12, section d). I collect evidence from different sources and reality check it between those sources. Then, I draw a conclusion, and re-check that conclusion with key stakeholders to get any further comments.
- 17.14 A minor point, the peer review says '*the majority of students would attend Huntly College*'. That is not correct, the SIA projects that few students from Sleepyhead Estate would be likely to attend Huntly College until/unless the trust of the community is won back.

Consistency with economics assessment

- 17.15 Beca says: Information relied upon '*appears inconsistent with other specialist assessment (e.g. economics)*' (Page 1, point 3c)

- 17.16 The SIA has conservatively assessed the number of new jobs arising from the Sleepyhead Factory alone, at 1,000. This aligns with the evidence of Mr Heath:⁸

"The primary activity on the site will be a newly built 100,00sqm TCG factory and rail siding facility (on a site of 29.95 hectares (net)), which is intended to be an amalgamation of TCG's production operations, eventually employing around 1,000 staff."

Timing of social services and infrastructure

- 17.17 Beca also suggests that social services and infrastructure should be in place prior to rezoning (Page 1, third-to-last paragraph).
- 17.18 It is an extraordinary request to require social infrastructure to be in place prior to zoning. Much social infrastructure is privately provided, such as ambulance, early childhood, GP. Other social infrastructure is Government-provided such as Police and schools. Simply, these organisations would never put in services before a population is present, let alone before zoning is approved. What can be done however, is signal when developer-provided social infrastructure will be built (as set out in planning provisions).
- 17.19 Beca seeks to have formal agreements between the developer and stakeholders, prior to zoning, to provide greater assurance that potential social effects might materialise. However, this moves discussions between the developer and stakeholders into a transactional, contract-like scenario, instead of working together for a successful relationship. Simply, relationships cannot be contracted. They are based on trust and reciprocal respect. NZ Comfort Group realise they will be a prominent part of local communities for decades to come. Relationships between the developer and stakeholders have been held since inception of the idea, and are developing well, e.g. with other landholders, iwi, and education institutions. These relationships have the potential to be powerful enablers of positive change in the community, whereas contracts would stifle, constrain and push organisations into a transactional mode⁹. During the JWS I was able to describe the ongoing work between APL, Wintec and Tainui regarding the

⁸ Statement of evidence of Tim Heath, paragraph 3.2.

⁹ Quigley and Watts Ltd (2014). How to improve your social licence to operate. Wellington: Ministry for Primary Industries.

Secondary School of Tertiary Studies, as explained in detail in the evidence of David Gaze.¹⁰

Transport infrastructure provision

17.20 Beca suggests that additional assessment of *'impacts on and opportunities for transport infrastructure provision ... (e.g. the State highway or rail siding opportunities, both of which are understood to be uncertain at this stage)'* is needed. Assessment of transport infrastructure is provided in the transport assessment. As discussed in the JWS, there was disagreement about the need to assess the effects of the new Huntly Bypass on Huntly businesses. In my opinion the Huntly Bypass is not a component of the Ohinewai Masterplan and any social effects arising from it would have been considered by the New Zealand Transport Agency in their Social Impact Assessment. Regardless, the potential social effects on Huntly businesses arising from the Ohinewai Masterplan have been well covered in the SIA.

Is the Sleepyhead Estate a "self contained settlement"?

17.21 Chloe Trenouth's Section 42A report concludes *'the APL proposal cannot be a 'self-contained' settlement; it lacks size/critical mass to be a fully functioning 'town' and as such it poses significant social and transport issues. APL proposes a population of potentially 2,500 - 3,000 people which is a large settlement in the context of the District'* (Executive Summary, page 3, points 8 and 9).

17.22 This is an overbold and unsubstantiated conclusion. I have detailed above why these fears are misplaced. I have never described the settlement as 'self-contained' and the Ohinewai Masterplan is not designed to be self-contained. No settlement of this size could be self-contained. Only very large towns/cities verge on being self-contained and even they too rely on large components of rural-based infrastructure to physically, economically and socially support them. I reiterate my SIA concludes the opposite to Chloe Trenouth's Section 42A report, especially when the Sleepyhead Estate is placed within the social context of Huntly and Te Kauwhata as my assessment does. My conclusion about the potential social effects of the development is below.

18. **CONCLUSIONS**

- 18.1 It is projected the development has potential District-wide social benefits arising from employment. Local people look forward to the jobs and income from the Masterplan, especially those in Huntly. The employment is within an environment of low median incomes and declining numbers of businesses in Huntly and Te Kauwhata. Furthermore, the social benefits of employment are potentially substantial, at the individual, family and community level.
- 18.2 Similarly, it is projected the Masterplan has potential District-wide social benefits arising from housing. The development has the potential to provide affordable housing, allowing people to live, work and play in the same township. The employment-led Masterplan is assessed to help maintain the population of Huntly (which is declining) and support the housing-led development in Te Kauwhata (which has not grown at the rate expected).
- 18.3 One potential moderate negative social effect relates to the three houses on the eastern side of Lumsden Road who may sell/move. Negotiations are underway with respect to the purchase of those properties that are within the proposed rezoning area.
- 18.4 Overall, the Masterplan is assessed to positively contribute to the way of life of local communities.

Robert Quigley
9 July 2020